Text Dependent Analysis – Close Reading Lessons for *Lemonade: The Musical* by Paul Acampora

Grade 5 Comprehension and Analysis of Characterization and Theme Based on the Text Dependent Analysis Annotated Student Responses

For students to successfully respond to text dependent analysis prompts, they should engage in close reading lessons. Close reading involves the use of a collection of evidence-based comprehension strategies embedded in a teacher-guided discussion, planned around repeated readings of a text to increase student comprehension. Close reading will often lead students to discover something important that may have been overlooked the first time they read the text. Throughout a close reading, teachers can use text dependent questions to promote discussion and help students to better understand the nuances of what they are reading. Text dependent questions can be used to start student discussions and give students opportunities to discuss the text with each other and voice their ideas. Successful analysis requires a study of the text in which students are able to analyze over and over again. The Pennsylvania Academic Standards for English Language Arts require moving instruction away from generic questions to questions that require students to analyze what they are reading. This will help to ensure that students are college and career ready.

Considerations for the Grade 5 Close Reading Lessons

The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) close reading lessons are designed to be an example pathway for teaching comprehension and analysis of the reading elements characterization and theme. The Instructional Plan guides teachers through the planning and teaching of each lesson, as well as modeling the response to a TDA prompt. The following instructional pathway focuses on the text *Lemonade: The Musical* and the corresponding prompt found in the Grade 5 Annotated Student Responses Based on the Text Dependent Analysis Learning Progressions. The lessons are only one possible instructional pathway and teachers should feel free to...
modify them to meet the sequence of their curriculum, accommodate content previously taught, or to meet their current students’ needs.

The lessons make the assumption that students may have been exposed to text dependent analysis prompts, the definition of analysis, and the deconstruction of prompts prior to reading the text to set a focus for reading. The close reading lessons incorporate some of these expectations; however, teachers may include additional modifications if needed.

### Text Dependent Analysis Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Lemonade: The Musical by Paul Acampora</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Complexity</td>
<td>Lexile level: 680 (Grade 5; 770-980)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Lexile and Qualitative analysis)</td>
<td>Qualitative level: Less to Moderately complex</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** the flashback may contribute to the complexity of this passage.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reading Elements/Structure for analysis</th>
<th>Characterization and Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>CC.1.3.5.A – Key Ideas and Details (Theme): Determine a theme of a text from details in the text, including how characters in a story or drama respond to challenges or how the speaker in a poem reflects upon a topic; summarize the text.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC.1.3.5.B – Key Ideas and Details (Text Analysis): Cite textual evidence by quoting accurately from the text to explain what the text says explicitly and make inferences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC.1.3.5.C – Key Ideas and Details (Literary Elements): Compare and contrast two or more characters, settings, or events in a story or drama, drawing on specific details in the text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC.1.4.5.S – Response to Literature: Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research, applying grade-level reading standards for literature and informational texts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC.1.4.5.B – Informative/Explanatory (Focus): Identify and introduce the topic clearly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC.1.4.5.C – Informative/Explanatory (Content): Develop the topic with facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples related to the topic; include illustrations and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Thompson TDA Model

CC.1.4.5.D – Informative/Explanatory (Organization): Group related information logically linking ideas within and across categories of information using words, phrases, and clauses; provide a concluding statement or section; include formatting when useful to aiding comprehension.

CC.1.4.5.E – Informative/Explanatory (Style): Write with an awareness of style. • Use precise language and domain-specific vocabulary to inform about or explain the topic. • Use sentences of varying length.

Instructional Text Dependent Analysis Prompt

In “Lemonade: The Musical,” the author tells about a boy who becomes a member of his school’s drama club. Write an essay analyzing how the author uses the different traits of the characters to reveal a theme of the passage. Use evidence from the text to support your response.

Purpose and Use of the Instructional Plan

It is important to understand that at the beginning of fifth grade, students are 10 years old and are still practicing the ability to transfer oral analysis responses to written analysis responses. The purpose of this Instructional Plan is to provide an example of how to organize close reading lessons that will lead students to understand the components of text dependent analysis (reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing).

In this plan the teacher builds on what students learned in grade 4 by modeling for students how to annotate the text to identify accurate evidence, how to make an inference about the evidence, what it means relative to the reading elements/structure, and how to construct an essay conveying this information. The close reading lessons are intended to guide instruction and not to assess student work using a grade or score.

The Instructional Plan is structured with the following three questions in mind:

• What are the planned activities and text dependent questions used to engage students in the targeted learning?
• What are the teacher actions for each of the activities?
• What are the student actions for each of the activities?

Each task is numbered and contains three parts:

• Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions
• Teacher Actions
• Student Actions

It is imperative to read the entire task to understand the structure of the Instructional Plan and the interaction of the three parts. Each part of the task guides the teacher throughout the planning and teaching of the lessons.
The Instructional Plan

Task #1

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
In this task the teacher will engage students in an activity that requires students to work together (e.g., Goodie Bag Skit). To support students with this activity, the teacher should guide students to focus on positive personality traits of the group members that helped them collaborate while creating the skit.

Teacher Actions:
• Review the elements of a basic story plot: characters, setting, problem, events, solution. Discuss how stories often have a theme or author’s message. Remind students of stories they have read that provided the reader with a theme.
• Divide the class into teams of up to four or five students and provide each team with a “goodie bag” filled with several random items and a theme statement (e.g., Working together is better than working alone). Set a time limit (e.g., 30-45 minutes) for each group to work together to create a short 10-minute skit using the items in the bag and the theme statement. Identify the criteria for the skit as a person or group of persons have a problem, a series of events occur that allow the problem to be solved by the end of the skit and the skit reveals the theme to the audience. Encourage students to think of a theme they want the audience to understand at the end of the skit. Remind students that all items in the goodie bag must be used.
• Display chart papers with a group number written at the top around the room.
• Number each group and have each group present their skit to the class. As other students watch the other skits, they should record the problem, events, solution to the problem, and theme of the skit on post-it notes and then place the post-it notes on the corresponding chart paper. Discuss similarities and differences in student responses ensuring that students can discern the different elements of a story.
  - Debrief by posing the following questions:
    ✔ In what ways was it helpful to work with others to create the skit? (Note: encourage students to consider different personality traits of others in the group. For example, “Jamal is very creative and could think of different ways the items in the goodie bag could be used!” If needed, refer to a character trait anchor chart or create one ahead of this lesson.)
  - What lesson or theme can we learn from working with others to create the skit?
• Point out that a theme statement isn’t directly told in the story or in the activity but comes from how people or characters behave, what they say, what they do, and what they think. Explain that a theme statement in texts is also a message we can learn about in life.

Student Actions:
• In groups, students use all the materials in the goodie bag to work together to create a skit that illustrates a student or group of students having a problem, with a series of events showing how the problem is solved and relaying a message or theme for the audience.
• Students watch the skits performed in class, record the problem, events, solution, and theme. They record on post-it notes and place on charts.
• Students debrief by responding to the questions related to working with others to create and/or perform the skit. Refer to the character trait anchor chart to identify personality traits of peers that helped support the creation of the skit.
• Students develop a theme statement about working with others.
• Students relate the skit theme statement to themes from narrative texts that they have read.

Task #2

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
• In this task the teacher will introduce the text Lemonade: The Musical and TDA prompt. The prompt should be deconstructed prior to reading the text.

Note: See TDA Series – The Anatomy of a Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Prompt

Note: See Learning Progression Guides – Annotated Student Responses Based on the Text Dependent Analysis – Grades 4 and 5 – instructional next steps for theme

Teacher Actions:
• Tell students they will be reading a story that has similarities to their Goodie Bag Skits and ask students to read the title of the story. Have students turn and talk to predict what they think will happen in the story.
• Display the TDA prompt and read it aloud as students follow along.
• Ask students to turn and talk about the purpose and meaning of the three statements in the prompt. Listen to students’ responses.
• Draw students’ attention to the second statement in the prompt: Write an essay analyzing how the author uses the different traits of the characters to reveal a theme of the passage.
• Ensure that students know the meaning of analysis (detailed examination of the elements or structure of text, by breaking it into its component parts to uncover interrelationships in order to draw a conclusion).
• Remind students how the theme of a story is determined referring to previous stories and the examination of characters to determine a theme, as well as the debrief of the Goodie Bag Skit.

Note: Prior to this lesson the teacher has identified how the theme of a story is often revealed by the character’s actions, thoughts, words, and feelings.

• Explain that as they read the story, Lemonade: The Musical!, they will annotate the text examining the different characters’ traits based on their actions, thoughts, and words and what they tell about a theme for the story.

Note: See TDA Series – Purposeful Annotations for Text Dependent Analysis (TDA)

• Ensure that students understand character traits. Provide each student with a character trait chart. Discuss that author’s use characters’ words, actions, thoughts, and feelings to describe a character’s personality.
The Thompson TDA Model

• Engage students in using a character’s actions, thoughts, words, and feelings to identify character traits after viewing a video clip from a show or movie.
• Use the video clip Up! – Meet Russell and ask students to identify:
  - **Actions:** What does a character do in the story? What does that tell you about him/her?
    • Mr. Harrison slams the door on Russell. One of Mr. Harrison’s character traits might be that he’s not very friendly.
  - **Words:** What does a character say in the story? What does that tell you about him/her?
    • Russell asks Mr. Harrison if he can help him cross something. One of Russell’s character traits might be that he is helpful.
  - **Feelings:** What does a character feel in the story? What does that tell you about him/her?
    • Russell points to where there is a missing badge for helping a senior citizen. One of Russell’s character traits might be that he is ambitious.

**Student Actions:**

• Students turn and talk to predict what will happen in the story.
• Students read the TDA prompt as the teacher reads it aloud taking note of the expectations in the second statement.
• Students discuss the meaning of analysis, theme, and characters’ actions, thoughts, and words to determine a theme.
• Students identify character traits based on a video clip.

**Task #3**

**Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:**

• In this task students will collaboratively discuss responses to text dependent questions to ensure comprehension of the text.
• The teacher will ensure students’ understanding of explicit evidence and inferences about the characters’ actions, thoughts, words, and feelings and how they reveal a theme about “working together is better than working alone.” Understanding and demonstrating this information is a prerequisite for students to analyze the text.

**Note:** Prior to this lesson the teacher may want to review the TDA Resource Purposeful Annotation for Text Dependent Analysis (TDA).

**Teacher Actions:**

• Explain that as students closely read and annotate the text, they will examine the different characters and how the character’s actions, thoughts, words, and feelings help reveal a theme related to working together.
• Display a copy of the text and provide copies to the students. Read aloud the first few paragraphs of the text. Think aloud while modeling how to mark the text and record marginal notes about the characters.
• After reading the first paragraph, say to students, *That’s an interesting idea to show students a lemon.*
• Tell the students, *This action shows me that Mr. Shaun is creative*; or ask the students, *What character trait does this show about Mr. Shaun?*
• Underline the evidence that supports the inference about Mr. Shaun and record in the margin.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mr. Shaun tips a brown bag onto his desk. A fat, yellow lemon wobbles and rolls across his papers and books. He picks up the citrus fruit. “Here,” he says, “Is where we begin.”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Shaun’s actions show that he is creative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reyna Sykes, my best friend in the sixth grade and the reason I’m at this Oakwood School Drama Club meeting, raises her hand, “What are we supposed to do with a lemon?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence to support that he is creative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Shaun, who looks a little bit like a lemon with black-frame glasses, nods. “Exactly.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>According to Reyna, Mr. Shaun always brings some kind of item—a broken toy or strange clothing or maybe an old photograph—to the first meeting of the year. It’s supposed to be inspiration, like a story starter, so that the Drama Club can write and perform its very own, original one-act musical for the entire school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Michael, you have to help,” Reyna had insisted when we saw the Drama Club announcements posted in the hallway last week.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I’m not in Drama Club,” I reminded her.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• After reading a section and annotating text, pose comprehension questions, such as:
  - *How does the author’s use of a flashback* (an event that takes place before the story begins) *help you understand the story events? Specifically, Reyna states, “Michael, you have to help, Reyna had insisted when we saw the Drama Club announcements posted in the hallway last week.”* (Explains how Michael joined the Drama Club.)
  - Why does Michael shout out his answers during the club’s brainstorming meeting? (He likes to be in control and have his ideas used.)
  - What does Michael view as “funny stuff”? How could these situations be “funny”? (Michael sees mishaps or unusual situations as funny.)

• Depending on the students’ strengths and needs, continue modeling while thinking aloud, annotating the text, and posing comprehension questions. For example, after reading the next paragraph, ask students to share their inferences about Reyna’s personality based on her words.
She pushed a strand of black hair out of her face. *You’re not in anything,* she said, as if I didn’t know. “No clubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year.”

I’ll think about it,” I said, but I didn’t mean it. Clubs meant doing things with others. I kind of preferred doing things myself.

“It will be fun,” Reyna promised. “Plus, you always have ideas that nobody else has. You see things that nobody else sees. You’re funny, Michael, and funny stuff happens to you all the time. You could make our play lots better.”

Funny stuff does seem to happen to me all the time. In the last couple of months, I accidentally ate dog food (it wasn’t that bad), fell into a gigantic pet store aquarium (it wasn’t my fault), and chased a squirrel into our school library (oops).

Reyna’s words: show that Michael doesn’t like to do things with others. Also, that Reyna is kind to her friend.

Michael’s words/thoughts: evidence he doesn’t like to do things with others.

Reyna’s words: show that Michael is creative.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character Traits and Evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beginning of the Story</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reyna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Shaun</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Explain that students will reread and use their annotations to provide evidence about each of the character’s traits and this information will be recorded on the organizer. Model, while thinking aloud and posing questions to guide students, such as:
  - **Thoughts**- What does Michael **think in the beginning** of the story? What does that tell you about him? *Michael is self-centered because he likes to do everything his way.*
    Evidence: *Clubs meant doing things with others. I kind of preferred doing things alone.*
    Continue to model, while thinking aloud, other evidence and inferences about the characters and recording on the class organizer as students record the information on their organizer. Continue in this manner until students are ready to complete this information in pairs or small groups with teacher guidance, recording the character trait and evidence for the beginning and end of the story.
• Have students share their thinking from their organizers and record a synthesis of students’ responses on the class chart posing questions and prompting students for clarification, as needed, to ensure that they have identified the character trait, evidence from the text, and an inference about how the evidence reveals the character trait.

• Remind students of the meaning of theme as a universal message or statement that can be applied to the real world based on what characters, say, do, think, and feel. Explain that they are going to determine a possible theme statement for the story using the information they collected from their annotations and recorded on their graphic organizer. Remind students that as they are working in small groups, they should refer back to the text to ensure that they understand what they recorded or to verify information if students in the small group have a different understanding of what the character said or meant.

• To model the small group discussion, select three or four students to be in the “fishbowl”, in which these students are in a small circle while all other students form an outer circle.

• Serve as a facilitator during this modeling process reminding students that the purpose of the small group is to discuss the text and determine a theme statement. Pose questions to move the conversation forward:
  - What do you think the author’s message was based on the character’s words and actions?
  - What evidence supports your thinking?
  - Does anyone disagree? Why? What evidence supports a different message?

• Students can be rotated into the fishbowl throughout the discussion to ensure student comfort in engaging in the conversation, and to ensure that students are returning to the text to substantiate their thinking.

• Debrief the fishbowl with questions such as:
  - What did you observe during the discussion of the text?
  - What is one thing you heard that is similar to your point of view?
  - What is one thing with which you disagree?
  - How did you feel while on the outside of the fishbowl?
  - How did you feel while on the inside of the fishbowl?

• Explain that they need to narrow down the number of theme statements to no more than four.
  - Place students in small groups to discuss and create a theme statement for the story and record their statement on a sentence strip.
  - Display the sentence strips and have students read them and discuss in small groups to determine if
    - there are duplicate theme statements and which one(s) should be removed,
    - there are any theme statements that do not seem to apply to the story, and/or
    - a theme statement may not have enough evidence from the text to support it.
  - One person from each group should place a post-it dot on the four statements that they believe best fits the story.
  - Select the four theme statements that have the most post-it dots and place one theme statement in each corner of the room.

**Student Actions:**

• Students respond to comprehension questions.
• Students follow along with the teacher reading aloud and annotating the first few paragraphs.
• Students work with a partner to pair read and annotate the remainder of the text focusing on evidence that supports character traits.
• Students use the text annotations to complete a graphic organizer showing how characters’ actions, thoughts, words, and/or feelings reveal a character trait from the beginning and ending of the story.
• Students discuss the meaning of the text to identify the best theme statements for the story.

Task #4

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
• In this task the teacher will engage students in understanding the meaning of analyzing text and how to demonstrate analysis in response to a text dependent analysis prompt.

Note: An analysis shows how two parts of the text are related to each other. In this task, a close reading provides students with the opportunity to think deeply about the character traits revealed in the text and to look for the relationship to the theme supported with explicit evidence and inferences.

Teacher Actions:
• Review the text dependent analysis prompt displayed earlier in the lesson:
  - In “Lemonade: The Musical,” the author tells about a boy who becomes a member of his school’s drama club. Write an essay analyzing how the author uses the different traits of the characters to reveal a theme of the passage. Use evidence from the text to support your response.
  - Review the meaning of analysis (detailed examination of the elements or structure of text, by breaking it into its component parts to uncover interrelationships in order to draw a conclusion) and discuss which elements they examined in the story.
  - Ask students to turn and talk to explain how the two elements (characters and theme) are interrelated. Encourage students to consider their annotations, discussions, and completion of the Character Traits and Evidence organizer.
  - Explain that they are going to use this information to create a well-organized essay to demonstrate their analysis. Display a writing organizer that shows how the body paragraph could be written for this prompt. For example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analyzing Text Paragraph</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify the character trait</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of the character trait from the text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inference – What the character trait means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explanation about the character trait and the inference made</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connection to the theme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Thompson TDA Model

- Discuss and identify information that is necessary in a body paragraph to demonstrate analysis:
  - Topic sentence as a general statement
  - Identification of the character and a trait
  - Evidence from the text that supports the identification of the character trait — discuss that the evidence for this text must be about the characters because their words, actions, thoughts, and feelings are what help to reveal the other reading element of theme
  - Inference about the evidence (This shows…)
  - Analysis — discuss that the analysis is the interrelationship of the two reading elements of character traits and theme. (This means… these character traits help to reveal a theme)
- Select a theme for modeling the writing of a body paragraph. For example, use the theme Working together is better than working alone; model while thinking aloud a topic sentence for the body paragraph.
- Explain that the topic sentence should introduce which character they are going to be writing about, the character trait that is demonstrated based on the evidence, and when this trait was displayed — beginning or end of the story (yellow highlight in reread activity). Remind students to use their graphic organizer to make these decisions.
- While thinking aloud, model writing explicit evidence that supports the character trait (green highlight in reread activity) and an inference about the evidence (blue highlight in reread activity).
- Explain to students that they cannot assume that the reader understands what this information means, and they need to explain and elaborate its meaning (pink highlight in reread activity).
- Finally, explain that they need to show what the evidence and inference mean by connecting it to the theme (orange highlight in reread activity).
- Reread the paragraph aloud while highlighting the character trait in yellow, the explicit evidence in green, the inference in blue, the explanation in pink, and how the evidence and inference connect to a theme in orange.
- A possible first body paragraph could state:

  The character Michael begins the story as **self-centered**. When the club is brainstorming ideas for a new musical, Michael didn’t want to consider anyone else’s ideas but his own. Michael’s trait of being self-centered drives him to only want to work alone, but there is no role for someone to do things by themselves. As he experiences the show coming together, he learns that he either has to work cooperatively or he won’t really be able to participate. At the end of the story, Michael realizes that the “…red stage curtain lifts twice as fast as when I do it myself.” This thought reveals his realization that working together allows for a better outcome.

- Review the theme statements that were placed in the four corners of the room from Task #3, and have students self-select the theme that they would like to support through their analysis.
- Provide each of the four groups with the writing organizer that reminds them of the information to be included in their body paragraph. Explain that they should collaboratively determine the information to include in their paragraph by first completing the writing organizer. Then they should use the information to collaboratively construct their paragraph on a piece of chart paper. If desired, the larger groups can be subdivided into smaller groups within the four corners.
- Allow students time to work in their groups to write their paragraph and display these around the room.
**Student Actions:**

- Students follow along as the prompt and meaning of analysis is reviewed and identify the two reading elements to be analyzed.
- Students follow along with the teacher modeling of writing of an analysis paragraph.
- Students self-select a theme statement and move to the corner of the room that has the theme statement displayed.
- Students work collaboratively to record information on the Character Trait and Evidence organizer and write an analysis paragraph using the organizer information.

**Task #5**

**Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:**

- In this task the teacher and students will review the paragraphs to confirm that students have demonstrated analysis.
- The teacher will guide students in understanding the difference between analyzing and summarizing text.

**Note:** In advance of this task, the teacher will need to prepare a summary paragraph on chart paper for review with students.

**Note:** A summary is a brief paragraph that captures all the most important parts of the text and answers the who, what, when, where, how and why questions but expresses them in a shorter space and as much as possible in the reader’s own words.

**Note:** An analysis shows how two aspects of the text are interrelated. A close reading examines these reading elements looking for their meaning and relationship to one another supported with explicit evidence and inferences.

**Teacher Actions:**

- Display the prepared summary of the text and the paragraphs that students constructed on chart paper.
- Read aloud one of the displayed paragraphs. Ask students to read along with you and silently determine:
  - what character trait is identified,
  - whether the evidence provided supports the character trait,
  - if there is an accurate inference about the character trait,
  - if there is explanation about the character trait and inference, and
  - whether the evidence and inference connect to the identified theme.
- Model naming the expectations of the paragraph (e.g., *The students specifically identified Michael's character trait as selfish and used evidence from the text to support their thinking. When Michael states … this clearly shows someone who is being selfish.*)
- Continue modeling the review of the group paragraphs to ensure all students recognize and understand the different aspects necessary for writing a paragraph which demonstrates text
Text Dependent Analysis – Close Reading Lesson (Grade 5)   l   September 2021

The Thompson TDA Model

analysis. Take note if students summarized rather than analyzed the text and guide their understanding of analysis.

- After the analysis review, engage students in a turn & talk discussion of the difference between analyzing text and summarizing text. Have students identify the information that is included in a summary, such as naming:
  - **Who** is in the story
  - **When** the story takes place
  - **Where** the story takes place
  - **What** the story is about
  - **How** and/or **why** the problem/solution occurred

- After students discuss in turn & talk, conduct a whole group discussion on the similarities and differences between analyzing and summarizing text. Use the information from the discussion to create an anchor chart showing the similarities/differences of the two types of writing. For example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analyzing Text</th>
<th>Similarities</th>
<th>Summarizing Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Identify a specific reading element (depends on the prompt)</td>
<td>Refers to a specific text</td>
<td>• Who is in the story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identify evidence to support the reading element (depends on the prompt)</td>
<td>Includes text evidence</td>
<td>• When the story takes place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Make an inference about the identified reading element</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Where the story takes place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Provide an explanation about the evidence and inference</td>
<td></td>
<td>• What the story is about</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Make a connection between the reading elements</td>
<td></td>
<td>• How and/or why the problem/solution occurred</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Without informing students that the teacher written paragraph is a summary, ask students to work with a partner or small group to review the paragraph and determine whether it is an analysis or a summary and to be prepared to justify their thinking using evidence from the paragraph.
- As students discuss the paragraph, circulate pointing out the expectations for each type of writing from the anchor chart.
- During the whole class discussion, engage students in identifying the who, when, where, what, how/why aspects of the summary using a colored marker to highlight the information.

**Student Actions:**
- Students follow along with the expectations of the analysis paragraph.
- Students discuss the expectations of a summary and contribute to the development of an anchor chart that distinguishes the similarities/differences of analyzing and summarizing a text.
- Students collaboratively review the paragraph noting evidence to justify whether it is written as a summary or an analysis.
The Thompson TDA Model

- Students share their thinking about the paragraph during a whole group discussion.

Note: A summary can be used as an introduction of the text dependent analysis response.

Task #6

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task, the teacher will prepare students to independently write an essay drawing evidence from the passage to support analysis while applying grade-level writing standards.
- The teacher will collect student responses to determine strengths and needs with respect to the ability to demonstrate the underlying components of a text dependent analysis essay (reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing). The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Learning Progressions will assist the teacher in determining next instructional steps.

Note: Districts and teachers use different writing organizers that assist students in organizing their writing. The organizer that is taught and used can be incorporated in this lesson plan.

- In fifth grade, compositional writing for a text dependent analysis response should include:
  - introduction of the topic and concluding statement or section
  - multiple paragraphs with one idea per paragraph or one paragraph with multiple ideas
  - specific details and evidence from the text
  - inferences about the evidence
  - explanation of what the evidence and inference mean
  - elaboration showing an interrelationship

Note: Students should understand the difference between the expectations of an essay and a short answer question.

Note: Fifth grade students may start with one paragraph and progress to multiple paragraphs by the end of the year.

Note: An analysis shows how two aspects of the text are related to each other. A close reading examines the characteristics of the text looking for their meaning and relationship to one another supported with explicit evidence and inferences.

Teacher Actions:
- Divide the class in two groups. Assign group 1 to the introductory paragraph and group 2 to the concluding paragraph.
- Ask students to brainstorm what should be included in an introductory paragraph for the text dependent analysis essay and what should be included in their concluding paragraph.
- Have students record their ideas on a piece of notebook paper and be prepared to share.

Note: Brainstorming can include any answers that students provide, not just the right answers.
The Thompson TDA Model

• As students are brainstorming, ask probing questions such as:
  - How could you begin your essay?
  - What can an introductory statement or section include?
  - Should you include the title and author of the story?
  - Can the introduction include a summary? Why or why not?
  - Should you include the reading elements you are going to analyze?
  - How could you end your essay?
  - Should you restate the reading elements?
  - Should you include a summary?
  - What else do you want the reader to know?

• Ask students to share the information that was generated about the introductory paragraph and record on chart paper. Discuss with students that the introduction should provide enough information to help the reader know what the following paragraphs are about.

• Model writing an introductory paragraph that includes 1) the title of the text, 2) a short 1-2 sentence summary, 3) the first reading element (naming the characters), 4) theme, and 5) restatement of the prompt expectation. For example:

  In “Lemonade: The Musical,” a group of middle school drama club students are putting together a new production. The main character, Michael, isn’t very enthusiastic about participating, but his friend Reyna convinces him to join. Michael is reluctant to become engaged, and whenever he does share ideas, he expects his teacher to use them. Through the process of putting together the show, Michael learns it is better to work together than to work alone. The author of the text uses the different traits of the characters in the story to reveal this theme.

• Ask students to share the information that was generated about the concluding paragraph and record on chart paper. Discuss with students that the conclusion should provide enough information to help the reader know that they understood the information provided about the text analysis.

• Model writing a concluding paragraph that includes 1) restating the reading elements discussed, 2) restating the main points that were made about the reading elements. For example:

  The characters of Michael and Mr. Shaun exhibit character traits that help reveal the theme of it being better to work together than alone. Michael, although he is self-centered, learns through his experiences that there is value to cooperating with others. Mr. Shaun’s patience helps give Michael the space he needs to figure out how rewarding it can be to cooperate.

**Note:** Depending on when this lesson is implemented and how often a response to a TDA prompt has been modeled, the writing instruction can be modified by the teacher implementing this lesson. Reminder – a summary is not an analysis.

• Place students in pairs based on which theme corner they previously worked in and have them collaboratively construct an introductory paragraph, a second body paragraph, and a concluding paragraph. Remind students to return to the text to locate the expectations for the body paragraph:
  - character trait,
  - evidence that supports the character trait,
The Thompson TDA Model

- inference about the character trait,
- explanation about the character trait and inference, and
- connection of the evidence and inference to the identified theme.

• Collect student essays. These essays should be analyzed to determine students’ strengths and needs based on the TDA Learning Progressions, and to determine instructional next steps.

Note: See TDA Series –Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Learning Progressions

Student Actions:
• Students brainstorm what information should be included in the introductory and concluding paragraphs of a TDA essay.
• Students follow along as the teacher models writing an example introductory and concluding paragraph.
• Students work with a partner to write a new introduction, second body paragraph that demonstrates analysis, and a new concluding paragraph.

Many thanks to Heather Dziky, Sarah Woodward, Lynn Henney, Diane Simaska, and Rebekah Baum-Leaman for their contributions to this instructional plan.