



Text Dependent Analysis – Instructional Prompt Guide

Grade 5 Annotated Student Responses Based on the Text Dependent Analysis Learning Progressions

The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) grade-span Learning Progressions (LPs) are designed to be used as an instructional tool. The TDA LPs are structured in grade spans (3-5 and 6-8) with four levels, *Beginning*, *Emerging*, *Developing*, and *Meeting*. The levels describe the typical path we see in student responses as the student moves toward demonstrating more sophisticated understanding of analysis. The LPs include descriptions of student work which characterize each level from a beginning TDA writer to one who is meeting the expectations of text dependent analysis essay writing. The TDA LPs can be used by teachers to identify student strengths and needs based on what a student **can** do at a specific point in time. This informs the teacher’s instructional decision-making about moving student comprehension, analysis and writing to the next level.

How to Use this Guide

The Text Dependent Analysis Instructional Prompt Guide contains the following sections: text complexity, instructional text-dependent analysis prompt, example proficient student response as written by the teacher, grade-level text, annotated student work, and possible instructional next steps.

- Text complexity includes the quantitative and qualitative measures of the text and the identified reading elements/structure for analysis. This information guides the teacher when choosing appropriate texts for instruction.
- The instructional prompt uses the reading elements as identified in the previous section.



- The example proficient student response, as written by the teacher, reflects the teacher’s expectation for a fifth grade student’s proficient response to the instructional prompt. This critical step allows the teacher to uncover: if the text offers enough evidence and complexity for students to use when responding to the prompt; the appropriateness of the prompt in relation to the text; and to verify the use of the identified reading elements (grade-level curriculum).
- The annotated student responses use the learning progression levels (*beginning, emerging, developing, and meeting*) to identify the student’s strengths and areas of need regarding the underlying components of text dependent analysis (*reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing*).
- The last section following each response provides the teacher with possible instructional next steps to meet the student’s areas of need.

Text Complexity	
Text	<i>Lemonade: The Musical</i> by Paul Acampora
Complexity (Lexile and Qualitative analysis)	Lexile level: 680 (Grade 5; 770-980) Qualitative level: Less to Moderately complex Note: <i>the flashback may contribute to the complexity of this passage</i>
Reading Elements/Structure for analysis	Characterization and Theme ¹

Instructional Text Dependent Analysis Prompt

In “*Lemonade: The Musical*,” the author tells about a boy who becomes a member of his school’s drama club. Write an essay analyzing how the author uses the different traits of the characters to reveal a theme of the passage. Use evidence from the text to support your response.

Example Proficient Student Response as Written by the Teacher

In “*Lemonade: The Musical*,” a group of middle school drama club students are putting together a new production. The main character, Michael, isn’t very enthusiastic about participating, but his friend Reyna convinces him to join. Michael is reluctant to become engaged, and whenever he does share ideas he expects his teacher to use them. Through the process of putting together the show, Michael learns it is better to work together than to work alone. The author of the text uses the different traits of the characters in the story to reveal this theme.

The character Michael begins the story as self-centered. When the club is brainstorming ideas for a new musical, Michael didn’t want to consider anyone else’s ideas but his own. Michael’s trait of being self-centered drives him to only want to work alone, but there is no role for someone to do things by themselves. As he experiences the show coming together, he learns that he either has to work cooperatively or he won’t really be able to participate. At the end of the story, Michael realizes that the “...red stage curtain lifts twice as fast as when I do it myself.” This inner thought reveals his realization that working together allows for a better outcome.



Mr. Shaun is a patient and encouraging character. No matter how many kids have ideas during the brainstorming session, he pays attention to them all. Even when Michael displays a poor attitude after he finds out he is on Stage Crew, he tries to keep Michael involved. Mr. Shaun continues to encourage Michael to do jobs that involve working with others, no matter how much Michael grumbles about it. When Michael is asked to make the robot sketches, Mr. Shaun says, “They have to be epic... We’re counting on you.” Through his encouragement, Michael begins to involve himself in the play, even though the ideas weren’t just his. Mr. Shaun’s patience allows for Michael to learn the value of cooperation on his own.

The characters of Michael and Mr. Shaun exhibit character traits that help reveal the theme of it being better to work together than alone. Michael, although he is self-centered, learns through his experiences that there is value to cooperating with others. Mr. Shaun’s patience helps give Michael the space he needs to figure out how rewarding it can be to cooperate.

Text: *Lemonade: The Musical* by Paul Acampora

Mr. Shaun tips a brown bag onto his desk. A fat, yellow lemon wobbles and rolls across his papers and books. He picks up the citrus fruit. “Here,” he says, “Is where we begin.”

Reyna Sykes, my best friend in the sixth grade and the reason I’m at this Oakwood School Drama Club meeting, raises her hand, “What are we supposed to do with a lemon?”

Mr. Shaun, who looks a little bit like a lemon with black-frame glasses, nods. “Exactly.”

According to Reyna, Mr. Shaun always brings some kind of item—a broken toy or strange clothing or maybe an old photograph—to the first meeting of the year. It’s supposed to be inspiration, like a story starter, so that the Drama Club can write and perform its very own, original one-act musical for the entire school.

“Michael, you have to help,” Reyna had insisted when we saw the Drama Club announcements posted in the hallway last week.

“I’m not in Drama Club,” I reminded her.

She pushed a strand of black hair out of her face, “You’re not in anything,” she said, as if I didn’t know. “No clubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year.”

“I’ll think about it,” I said, but I didn’t mean it. Clubs meant doing things with others. I kind of preferred doing things myself.

“It will be fun,” Reyna promised. “Plus, you always have ideas that nobody else has. You see things that nobody else sees. You’re funny, Michael, and funny stuff happens to you all the time. You could make our play lots better.”



Funny stuff does seem to happen to me all the time. In the last couple of months, I accidentally ate dog food (it wasn't that bad), fell into a gigantic pet store aquarium (it wasn't my fault), and chased a squirrel into our school library (oops).

"Last year's story starter was an old pair of sneakers," Reyna went on. "If you don't help, the school might see an updated version of The Stinky Shoes Man."

"That wasn't good," I recalled.

"I don't want to sing, 'Another Shoelace, Another Toe' ever again."

I couldn't put Reyna through Stinky Shoes again. So now I'm in Drama Club.

I raise my hand.

"Michael?" says Mr. Shaun.

"When you've got lemons—"

Mr. Shaun cuts me off, "Make lemonade?"

It doesn't really sound like a question, so I don't reply.

Mr. Shaun stands, "That's good advice. Unfortunately, advice is not what we're looking for. We're looking for a story. And when it comes to stories, the best ingredients are mishaps, misadventures, and complications."

Mishaps, misadventures, and complications—like dog food, pet-story aquariums, and library squirrels. These are ingredients I'm familiar with. I raise my hand again. "Lemonade is not what I was going to say."

"Oh?" says Mr. Shaun.

"I was going to say lemonade STAND."

Mr. Shaun raises an eyebrow.

"When you've got lemons, make a lemonade stand."

Across the room, Nick Vincent, a lanky seventh-grader with floppy black hair, leans forward. "There should be two lemonade stands," he says.



“Why?” asks Mr. Shaun.

“There’d be more competition, more conflict, and there’d be more parts to play. In fact,” Nick continues, “there should be a whole bunch of lemonade stands. Maybe 8 or 12 or 20. They could all be rivals.”

“Lemonade war!” one of our classmates hollers.

“Wait a minute,” I say, because this has nothing to do with anything that I wanted to suggest. Honestly, I don’t even have ideas to suggest yet. But we’ve hardly started and the story is already out of control.

Mr. Shaun moves to the front of his desk. “How exactly would one fight a lemonade war?”

“Lemonade slingshots!” shouts one kid.

“Lemonade squirt guns!” says another.

“Tropical-fruit catapults!” suggests Reyna.

“Giant cardboard flame-throwing robots!” I holler, because I don’t want to be left out.

Mr. Shaun holds up a hand. “Catapults are excellent. Robots are awesome, and we have plenty of cardboard.” He pauses, “Sadly, we can’t have flamethrowers.”

“Awwww”, says everybody.

“But we still need characters and songs, and what about plot? People like plot.”

I throw my hand into the air and wave madly. “I have ideas!” I yell. I mean, that’s why I came to this meeting. But rather than make a story, I feel like I’m chasing a bushel of lemons off a cliff.

“You got the ball rolling,” Mr. Shaun tells me. “Now let’s make sure everybody else gets a turn.” He points to Gabrielle Colette, a pony-tailed fifth-grader, whose voice is loud enough to crack marble.

“THERE’S A GIRL, AND SHE WANTS A PUPPY, SEE? HER NEIGHBOR IS A MAD SCIENTIST, AND HE WANTS TO RULE THE WORLD, RIGHT? AND THEN THEY BOTH START THEIR OWN LEMONADE STANDS.”

“We’re definitely talking about a lot of lemonade stands,” says Nick.



“They could be like competing fast-food chains,” suggests Reyna.

“I don’t even like fast food!” I complain.

“Michael,” says Mr. Shaun, “this isn’t just about you.”

“But—“

“We’re all in this together.”

I whisper to Reyna, I didn’t join Drama Club to be all in this together!”

Reyna laughs, “Michael,” she says, “you are so funny.”

Mr. Shaun turns to the board where he’s written everybody’s ideas. “It looks like we’ve got a lemonade and cardboard-robot plus puppy-girl-versus-mad-scientist battle and musical extravaganza. I think I smell a hit!”

“I think I smell puppy pee,” I mutter.

Mr. Shaun laughs and writes THAT’S NOT LEMONADE on the board.

By the end of the week, Mr. Shaun has assigned parts. Gabrielle will play the puppy-obsessed girl. Nick is the mad scientist. Reyna gets cast as a kooky neighbor. I find my name on a list labeled STAGE CREW.

In the school auditorium for the first rehearsal, Reyna leans toward me and whispers, “This is going really well!”

“Seriously?” I say.

“It’s LOADS better than *Stinky Shoes!*”

I leave the auditorium and head to the art room, where I find Mr. Shaun along with a handful of other kids. They’re standing between piles of cardboard and wood and tools and art supplies. Mr. Shaun points at the stuff around us. “All this needs to be turned into our set. Think you can handle it?”

I cross my arms. This is not a part of the show I wanted to work on.

Our teacher turns to me. “Michael, I want you to make sketches for the giant robots that we’ll need for the epic puppy-girl-versus-mad-scientist battle and finale.”



“The robots?” I say.

“They have to be epic,” Mr. Shaun says, handing me some pencils and a drawing pad. We’re counting on you.”

I sit at a corner desk and begin to draw. Drama Club is not working out the way I expected, but at least there are robots. I sketch stilts and blinking lights and bullhorns. These robots will tower and glower and roar. Unfortunately, I have no idea how to actually build them.

“We can definitely do that,” says Shelly Brown, an eighth-grade stage-crew captain who is looking over my shoulder.

I show her my robot drawing. “We can really make this?”

“No problem. We’ll build it together.”

“How?”

Shelly points at the building supplies piled in front of a massive wooden sneaker from last year’s *Stinky Shoes* production. “This is the theater,” she tells me. “We can make magic happen.”

By opening night, our sets are complete, the story is in place, and best of all, there’s a blinking cardboard-robot army waiting in the wings. Mr. Shaun finds me beside the stage curtain, which I’m supposed to open when I get my cue. “So,” he says, “what do you think of your show, Michael?”

“It’s not my show,” I tell him.

“We’re staging a musical comedy about lemonade. Wasn’t that your idea?”

“My idea was lemonade stands,” I say. “The rest is from everybody else.”

And that’s when it hits me. The play is way different than something I would have come up with myself. It’s messier. Sillier. And probably better. Mr. Shaun smiles a little, but he doesn’t say anything. It seems he knows what I’m thinking.

On the other side of the stage, Reyna begins waving at me like a maniac. It’s my cue to open the curtain. “Want to give me a hand?” I ask my teacher.

“Sure,” says Mr. Shaun. “Opening the curtain is my favorite part.”



The Thompson TDA Model

He puts his hands on the rope, and we pull. The long, red stage curtain lifts twice as fast as when I do it myself.

Storyworks.Scholastic.com; January 2015, pgs. 21-23

All material on Scholastic.com without limitation is protected by U.S. and foreign copyright and trademark laws. Scholastic does not require written permission for personal, non-commercial use.



Student responses are analyzed and annotated for possible instructional next steps based on the Text Dependent Analysis Learning Progressions.

Example A	TDA Learning Progression Annotations
<p style="text-align: center;">Student Response</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Reading Comprehension: Meeting</p>
<p>In the short story, "Lemonade: The Musical," the author uses different traits of the characters to reveal the theme of the passage. The theme of this short story is "The best way to overcome an obstacle is to work as a team." Michael, who doesn't like working with others, is persuaded by Reyna, a kind friend who wants to make him a better person, to join the Drama Club. Mr. Shaun, a born leader and a wise person, helps Michael learn to work with a team, and the Drama Club creates their play together.</p> <p>Initially, Michael is a self-centered person, but towards the end of the story, his friend and his teacher help him realize cooperation is the best way to get around things. On page 21, the author states, "Clubs meant doing things with others, I kind of preferred doing things myself." This shows that in the beginning of the story, Michael prefers to work alone. On page 24, the text states, "[Mr. Shaun] puts his hands on the rope, and we pull. The long, red stage curtain lifts twice as fast as when I do it myself." This shows that Michael, in the end, becomes more involved in teamwork. Mr. Shaun and Reyna both push Michael to be a less self-centered person, and that if he works alone, he won't succeed. The character trait of being a person who wants to work alone relates to the theme by him changing in the end and realizing he should let others be the star.</p>	<p>An understanding of the prompt is demonstrated throughout the response by quotes and inferences showing how the characters' traits are interrelated to a theme of working together to overcome an obstacle. However, it is not completely clear what the obstacle is that needs to be overcome.</p> <p>Relevant key details are included throughout the essay demonstrating an understanding of the different characters (<i>Michael is self-centered, Reyna is kind and caring</i>) and how these traits support the theme. These key details support the inferences made about the thoughts and actions of the character and the need for cooperation.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Analysis: Developing/Meeting</p> <p>The use of direct quotes as text evidence is included and supports the inferences about the character and the theme (<i>Evidence...Mr. Shaun puts his hands on the rope, and we pull. The long red stage curtain lifts twice as fast as when I do it by myself.</i> Inference...</p>



The Thompson TDA Model

Additionally, Reyna tries to help Michael become a less self-centered person, and to work as a team with the Drama Club. On pg. 23, the author uses the words, "they could be like competing fast-food chains," suggests Reyna. "I don't even like fast food! I complain." This shows that Reyna is trying to make suggestions, but Michael is trying to take over as a leader. On page 21, the text states, "No dubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year." This shows that Reyna is trying to persuade Michael to join the Drama Club for his own benefit. Reyna wants Michael to do Drama Club because it will help them and make Michael more cooperative. Reyna's character trait of being caring and kind persuades Michael to join the Drama Club, where he becomes a cooperative person.

Moreover, Mr. Shaun, throughout the story, tries to show Michael that he isn't the star of everything. On pg. 23, the author states, "Michael," says Mr. Shaun, "this isn't just about you."

But, "We're all in this together." This shows that Mr. Shaun is trying to help Michael. Also on pg. 23, Mr. Shaun states, "Now let's make sure every body

Michael gets more involved in team work; Analysis...Mr. Shaun and Reyna both push Michael to be a less self-centered person, and to realize that if he works alone he won't succeed.)

Inferences about the character and the theme related to cooperation and working together along with the key details are included (*Michael is trying to take over as a leader, Reyna is trying to persuade Michael to join the Drama Club for his own benefit, Mr. Shaun is trying to help Michael*).

Explanations and elaboration to connect the evidence and inferences to the reading elements, character and theme, are included. However, the paragraph elaborating on Reyna's character traits is not fully developed (*Reyna's character trait of being caring and kind persuades Michael to join the Drama Club, where he becomes a cooperative person*) and the order of sentences detracts from the analysis. Earlier in the paragraph the student stated, *Reyna is trying to persuade Michael to join the Drama Club for his own benefit*. Reversing the order of these two sentences and providing a clearer explanation will allow for a stronger analysis.



<p>else gets a turn." This shows that Mr. Shawn doesn't want to make Michael the only one talking. Mr. Shawn helps Michael by showing him that anything can be done if you work with others on it. Mr. Shawn's character trait of being a leader helps Michael by giving him good advice and teaching him to play well with others.</p> <p>In the short story, "Lemonade the Musical," the author uses traits of the characters to reveal the theme. The best way to overcome obstacles is to work together. Michael, Reyna, and Mr. Shawn all cooperate to make the play. A lemon tree can't grow without the sun and water to help it.</p>	<p>Essay Writing: Meeting</p> <p>The organization is coherent and contains multiple paragraphs which focus on the specific individual character, and sophisticated transitional phrases are used (<i>Initially, Moreover</i>). The structure is generally logical, although at times, the ideas could be better grouped to allow a more coherent flow.</p> <p>A variety of sentence structures and beginnings are used.</p> <p>The grammar and spelling are appropriate.</p>
<p>Possible Instructional Next Steps:</p>	
<p>The focus for instruction should help students move along the Learning Progression continuum. This student demonstrates that s/he is meeting the underlying expectations for reading comprehension and essay writing. Therefore, the instructional focus for this student should be to strengthen the ability to analyze text, and more specifically, to provide a clear explanation and elaboration². The following suggestions will help the student move along the continuum.</p>	



1. Instructing for explanation and elaboration requires moving students beyond the “this shows that” statement. Often students provide a statement that helps connect the evidence and the reading elements being analyzed but lack one or two additional statements that explain the meaning of what they stated. The use of an organizer that specifically asks, *So what?*, will help students to extend the connection into a generalization. For example:

Explicit Evidence	Inference	What does it mean?	SO WHAT?
<i>No clubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year.</i>	<i>This shows that Reyna is trying to persuade Michael to join the Drama Club for his own benefit.</i>	<i>Reyna’s character trait of being caring and kind persuades Michael to join the Drama Club, where he becomes a cooperative person.</i>	<i>When people work together they can learn from the ideas of others and can accomplish more than they can do alone. By convincing Michael to join the Drama Club, the group gained from new ideas and Michael learned that he can do more with the help of others.</i>

2. Teaching sentence fluency in which the sentences are in the right place to create an effective analysis. Teaching sentence fluency requires modeling for students how to order sentences to construct a clear explanation of what the text means relative to the reading elements. One way to help students with sentence fluency is by using the organizer above. Also, students can be helped by providing them with paragraphs in which the order of sentences is jumbled and having them rearrange the sentences to resemble the organizer above. This will provide students with a needed structure.



Example B	TDA Learning Progression Annotations
<p style="text-align: center;">Student Response</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Reading Comprehension: Developing</p>
<p>Lemonade, The Musical, by Paula Acampora, is about a couple of middle schoolers, Michael and Reyna. Michael never really got in to extra-curricular activities. His friend Reyna, needs his help to save drama club from performing last years musical, "The Stinky Shoes Man." Reyna persuades him into joining her in the challenge to eventually come up with "That's Not Lemonade." Michael learns the importance of trying new things in this process, with the help of Reyna.</p> <p>The character Michael shows an example of an independant character. Michael never tried any extra-curricular activities and he would much rather do things by himself instead of as a team. He said "Clubs meant doing things with others. I kind of prefer to do things alone." Later in the story he learned that when he put his mind together with others, magic can happen.</p> <p>This contributes to the theme "It does not hurt to try new things" because he never liked to work with others and now he knows the importance of the trait, teamwork. When he was put on stage crew, he thought he would greatly despise it. But because he tried something</p>	<p>An understanding of the prompt is demonstrated throughout the response as the student uses Michael and Reyna's character traits as a basis for demonstrating the theme that <i>it does not hurt to try new things</i>.</p> <p>The introduction includes a short and accurate summary of the story as well as an identification of the theme (<i>the importance of trying new things</i>).</p> <p>Some inaccurate details are included causing misconceptions and unclear inferences.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Analysis: Emerging</p> <p>The details used to demonstrate the character traits are not fully connected to the theme provided. There are misconceptions (<i>Reyna is thoughtful because she thought up a scheme and went to all that trouble.</i>), some inaccurate information (<i>She got more than a musical for her deed.</i>), and some irrelevant information (<i>He was told "we make magic happen" implying that greatness comes in pairs.</i>).</p> <p>The explanations to connect the evidence and inferences to the reading elements (characters and theme) are unclear,</p>



The Thompson TDA Model

new, he does not have to miss out on things, that enjoyable. He was told "We make magic happen" implying that greatness comes in pairs. The theme It does not hurt to try new things because Michael did this for the greater good. For his classmates, friend, teacher, and the people who come see the show.

The character Reyna shows an example of a thoughtful character. She expresses this in the story, mostly towards Michael. She said "If you don't help, the school might see an updated version of The Stinky Shoes man. She despised that musical.

underdeveloped, and/or unrelated to the character and theme. For example, *She never gave up. That lead her to trying the trait perseverance. She understands that trying something new can lead to a catastrophe. But she also knows that you miss 100% of things if you don't try.* This explanation attempts to connect Reyna's trait of perseverance to the theme; however, the trait is not accurate and its connection to the theme is unclear, and the explanation does not relate to the meaning of the passage.

This action shows that she is thoughtful to Michael because she wanted to convince Michael to join an extra-curricular activity. She got more than a musical from her deed. It contributes to the theme. It does not hurt to try new things because Reyna tried last years musical and realize it was a fail. That led to her being thoughtful towards Michael to urge him to help with this years musical. From that Michael learned that he enjoys being creative. Reyna is thoughtful because she thought up a scheme and went to all that trouble. She never gave up that lead her to trying the trait perseverance. She understand that trying something new can lead to a catastrophe. But she also knows that you miss %100% of things you don't try.

The Fiction story "Lemonade, the musical" shows how different characters can express character traits. The author wrote this piece of text to teach us the theme, It does not hurt to try new things. She expresses this through the characters Michael and Reyna. they take risks and show how they can pay off in the end.

Essay Writing: Developing

The multi-paragraph organization is one in which ideas are generally grouped into paragraphs and transitions are used.

A clear introduction and conclusion is included.

Sentence structures are appropriate and varied, as is the vocabulary.

The grammar and spelling are appropriate.



Possible Instructional Next Steps:

The focus for instruction should help students move along the Learning Progression continuum. This student demonstrates that s/he is developing in the underlying expectations of reading comprehension and essay writing. Therefore, the instructional focus for this student should be moving the student from emerging to developing in the ability to analyze text². However, because analysis is impacted by reading comprehension, comprehension is also an area of instructional focus. The following suggestions will help the student move along the continuum.

- 1. Making inferences about the text evidence and ensuring an understanding of how characters actions show a theme** requires teaching the student to look for relationships between words and/or events and to make a connection to the theme. Although the student attempts to demonstrate this throughout the response, the student does not use specific evidence from the passage to show this understanding. Provide students with a graphic organizer to select specific evidence, make an inference by explaining what it tells about the character, and explain what it means with respect to a theme.

Explicit Evidence	Inference	What does it mean?
<i>You're not in anything. No clubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year. It will be fun. Plus you always have ideas that nobody else has. You see things that nobody else sees. You're funny Michael.</i>	<i>Reyna was a thoughtful and caring friend because she explained to Michael how he would be a great contribution to the Drama Club.</i>	<i>By trying something new he would bring something needed to the group and he might learn something from being in a club.</i>



2. Explaining and elaborating how the character trait is supported with precise and appropriate evidence to support the theme of *trying new things is beneficial* requires the student to go beyond general reading comprehension. The use of an organizer that specifically asks students to identify the character trait, find the evidence connected to the character trait, and then make the connection between the character trait and theme, may help students to extend the connection into a generalization. For example, the student could have included an explanation such as the following:

Character trait	Text evidence	How does the character trait reveal the theme?
Michael is self-centered.	When the drama club is brainstorming ideas for the new show, Michael doesn't like any ideas but his own.	Michael's trait of being self-centered drives him to only want to work alone, but there is no role for someone to do things by themselves. As he experiences the show coming together, he learns that he either has to work cooperatively or he won't really be able to participate.
Mr. Shaun is patient.	No matter how many kids have ideas during the brainstorming session, he pays attention to them all. Even when Michael's attitude is bad after he finds out he is on Stage Crew, Mr. Shaun tries to keep him involved.	Mr. Shaun's patience allows for Michael to learn the value of cooperation on his own. Mr. Shaun continues to encourage Michael to do jobs that involve working with others, no matter how much Michael grumbles about it.



Example C	TDA Learning Progression Annotations
Student Response	Reading Comprehension: Developing
<p>"Lemonade: The Musical" is about a boy named Michael who gets convinced by his best friend Reyna to join drama club and do a musical. At first, Michael is stubborn and uncooperative, but soon he learns that everyone else involved in the musical (including his teacher Mr. Shaun) is just trying to help in their own way. In "Lemonade: The Musical," the author uses the different traits of Michael, Reyna, and Mr. Shaun to reveal the theme of the passage. The theme of this article is that friends come in many forms. Reyna shows kindness and true friendship to Michael, who shows friendship even when frustrated. Mr. Shaun demonstrates fairness and kindness to all of the drama club members.</p> <p>To begin, Reyna is a true friend to Michael, who is sometimes a bit stubborn and stays with him even at his bad times. Michael and Reyna are best friends. In paragraph #13 of page #3, the text states, "I whisper to Reyna, 'I didn't join drama club to be all in this together.'" Reyna laughs, "Michael," she says, "You are so funny." Reyna wants Michael to have a good time and have fun in drama club. Therefore, she makes him feel better about himself out of true friendship. In here that he might become a little more easy-going. Because of Reyna's demonstration of true friendship and kindness, Michael knew he could have her to talk to at any time he needed it for relief from the drama club; which is hard for Michael to work with people in.</p> <p>Sometimes Michael is sometimes uncooperative when working with others, but the text proves that he still sustains his friendships and relationships with his peers. In paragraph #14 of page #4, Michael suggests, "Want to give me a hand? I ask my teacher (Mr. Shaun)." Michael is not always a stubborn person. He may sometimes feel ignored and misunderstood, but his relationships with Reyna and Mr. Shaun show that he is a kind person. Michael doesn't hurt his friends by being independent; that is why they are true friends. Michael always shows them in his own way how much he values his friendships with Reyna and Mr. Shaun, even if he is frustrated and also very different from both of them personality-wise.</p>	<p>An understanding of the prompt is demonstrated throughout the response as the student uses Michael and Reyna's character traits as a basis for demonstrating the theme that <i>friends come in many forms</i>. However, the theme is not accurate for this passage.</p> <p>The introduction includes a short and accurate summary of the story as well as an identification of the theme and an attempt at identifying the characters' personality traits.</p>



Thirdly, Mr. Shawn is a little strict with Michael sometimes, but he shows kindness and fairness to all of his students, including Michael, making him a friend and an equal to the children. In paragraphs #4 and #11, on page #3, Mr. Shawn says, "Now, let's make sure everyone else gets a turn," and, "We're all in this together." Mr. Shawn tries to be completely fair and equal to all of his students, which sometimes results in Michael being unhappy, but Michael also learning a lesson. Because of Mr. Shawn's kindness and helpfulness, the theater production "Lemonade: The Musical" is a success. All along, Mr. Shawn, who is kind of like a child himself, is just trying to juggle helping Michael and being fair to the other students at the same time.

To conclude, friends like Michael, Reyna and Mr. Shawn can come in many forms. This theme is proven by Michael, Mr. Shawn and Reyna, who all express their friendships with each other different ways, and have different personalities, but overall stay friends despite their moods, differences and personalities.

Analysis: Emerging

The details used to demonstrate the character traits are not fully connected to the theme provided. The inferences provided are a stretch to support this theme. There are misconceptions, some inaccurate information, and some irrelevant information (Character trait...


Reyna is a true friend.
Evidence... *You are so funny.*
Inference... *Reyna wants Michael to have a good time and fun in drama club. Therefore she makes him feel better about himself out of true friendship in hope that he might become a little more easy-going.* Analysis... *Because of Reyna's demonstration of true friendship and kindness, Michael knew he could have her to talk to at any time he needed it for relief from the drama club; which is hard for Michael to work with people in).*

The explanations to connect the evidence and inferences to the reading elements (characters and theme) are unclear, underdeveloped, and/or unrelated to the character and theme. For example, *(Michael doesn't hurt his friends by being independent; that is why they are true friends)*. This explanation attempts to explain the theme; however, because the theme is inaccurate, the explanation is disconnected from the passage.



	<p style="text-align: center;">Essay Writing: Meeting</p> <p>The structure/organization groups ideas into paragraphs and uses transitions within and between paragraphs.</p> <p>Sentence and word choice are varied.</p> <p>The grammar and spelling are appropriate.</p>
<p>Possible Instructional Next Steps:</p> <p>The focus for instruction should help students move along the Learning Progression continuum. This student demonstrates that s/he is meeting the underlying expectation for essay writing. Therefore, the instructional focus for this student should be moving the student from developing to meeting in their ability to demonstrate reading comprehension, and from emerging to developing when analyzing text². The following suggestions will help the student move along the continuum..</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Teaching students how to determine the theme starts with asking specific questions drawn from the text which require evidence to support the theme. For example, posing the question, <i>Should Michael be the only one to determine the focus of the play?</i> moves beyond a general question such as <i>What is the theme?</i> or beyond leading questions such as <i>Should Michael work with others to help make the play better?</i> Other questions that will encourage students to think about the theme are: <i>What did the author want us to think about? What message will you remember about the story a month from now?</i> 2. Selecting multiple and precise textual evidence to support the characters' traits requires the student to include details such as <i>Clubs meant doing things with others, I kind of preferred doing things myself, I cross my arms, and This is not a part of the show I wanted to work on.</i> This evidence will allow the student to understand that Michael is self-centered. Identifying this character trait with the events from the story will allow the student to develop a more appropriate theme. The use of images will help students identify explicit evidence and make inferences to support a theme. For example, using the Norman Rockwell painting <i>The Young Lady with the Shiner</i> (below) allows students to identify explicit evidence, make an inference, and explain how it relates to the character trait. 	



	What do you observe? (Explicit evidence)	What does it mean? (Inference – implicit evidence)	How does it relate to a character trait?
	Black eye	Got in a fight	She could be mischievous because she may have been looking for trouble

3. Making inferences about the text evidence and ensuring an understanding of how characters' actions show a theme requires teaching the student to look for relationships between words and/or events and make a connection to the theme. Although the student attempts to demonstrate this throughout the response, the student does not use specific evidence from the passage to show understanding. Provide students with a graphic organizer in order to select specific evidence, make an inference by explaining what it tells about the character, and what it means with respect to a theme. The teacher then models for students how to take the organizer information to construct a clear explanation of what the text means relative to the reading elements.

Explicit Evidence	Inference	What does it mean?
<i>You're not in anything. No clubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year. It will be fun. Plus you always have ideas that nobody else has. You see things that nobody else sees. You're funny Michael.</i>	<i>Reyna was a thoughtful and caring friend because she explained to Michael how he would be a great contribution to the Drama Club.</i>	<i>By trying something new he would bring something needed to the group and he might learn something from being in a club.</i>



Example D	TDA Learning Progression Annotations
<p style="text-align: center;">Student Response</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Reading Comprehension: Emerging</p>
<p>The author Paul Acometa wrote a fictional story called <i>Learn to be a loner</i>. In the story Michael finds himself at a drama club meeting because of his best friend, Peter. Michael is really into the show but his teacher has different plans. According to his bestie the teacher always brings something to act as an example. Michael then learns that working together is better than working as a loner.</p> <p>In the beginning Michael's character trait is <i>chill and sort of a loner</i>. In the end his trait is the opposite of a loner. The theme of the story is <i>Some things may seem horrible but they are not always as bad and can turn out awesome</i>.</p> <p>In conclusion the theme of the story</p>	<p>The expectations of the prompt are acknowledged when Michael's character traits of <i>chill and sort of a loner</i> are identified along with a theme.</p> <p>The introduction includes a short and accurate summary of the story as well as an identification of a theme, <i>working together is better than working as a loner</i>. The conclusion is a restatement of a revised theme.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Analysis: Beginning</p> <p>The text evidence provided allows for a summary of the text. No evidence is provided to connect the character traits to the theme. No inferences are made, and consequently there is no explanation and elaboration to connect the reading elements (character traits and theme). In the second paragraph the theme shifts to <i>some things may seem horrible but they are not always as bad and can turn out awesome</i>, but no explanation is provided to support either theme.</p>




	<p style="text-align: center;">Essay Writing: Emerging</p> <p>The organizational structure attempts to group ideas into paragraphs and uses transitions between paragraphs.</p> <p>The use of conversational vocabulary (<i>chill, awesome, bestie</i>) is distracting.</p> <p>The grammar and spelling are adequate.</p>
<p>Possible Instructional Next Steps:</p> <p>The focus for instruction should help students move along the Learning Progression continuum. This student demonstrates that s/he is emerging in the underlying expectations for reading comprehension and essay writing, and beginning for analysis. Therefore, the instructional focus for this student should be moving the student from beginning to emerging in analysis and emerging to developing in their ability to demonstrate reading comprehension and essay writing². The following suggestions will help the student move along the continuum.</p> <p>1. Making certain that students know the difference between a summary and analysis.</p> <p>Explain and model that a summary is a brief paragraph describing and informing three or more of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Who: those involved• What: the event or topic being covered• When: time, period, era, night or day• Where: the location, distance, place• Why: the cause or causes <p>Analysis requires examining the summary elements in order to look for their meaning and using text evidence to show the interrelationship of the summary elements. To successfully analyze text, students need to understand that authors make specific choices about literary and nonliterary elements, their craft and style, and text structures for particular reasons. Text dependent analysis responses should point out the author’s specific choices, describe “how” and “why” the author made those choices and for what particular reasons, explain their significance and/or impact, then draw a conclusion about the author’s meaning or message.</p>	



2. Teaching students how to determine the theme starts with asking specific questions drawn from the text which require evidence to support the theme. For example, posing the question, *Should Michael be the only one to determine the focus of the play?* moves beyond a general question such as *What is the theme?* or beyond leading questions such as *Should Michael work with others to help make the play better?* Other questions that will encourage students to think about the theme are: *What did the author want us to think about? What message will you remember about the story a month from now?*

3. Selecting multiple and precise textual evidence to support the characters' trait. The student could have included details such as *Clubs meant doing things with others. I kind of preferred doing things myself, I cross my arms, and This is not a part of the show I wanted to work on.* This evidence will allow students to understand that Michael is self-centered. Knowing this character trait and the events from the story will allow students to develop a more appropriate theme.

The use of images will help students to identify explicit evidence and make inferences to support a theme. For example, using the Norman Rockwell painting *The Young Lady with the Shiner* (below) will allow students to identify explicit evidence, make an inference, and explain how it relates to the character trait.

	What do you observe? (Explicit evidence)	What does it mean? (Inference – implicit evidence)	How does it relate to a character trait?
	Black eye	Got in a fight	She could be mischievous because she may have been looking for trouble



4. Making inferences about the text evidence and ensuring an understanding of how characters' actions show a theme. Although the student attempts to demonstrate this throughout the response, the student doesn't use specific evidence from the passage to demonstrate this understanding. Provide students with a graphic organizer in order to select specific evidence, make an inference by explaining what it tells about the character, and what it means with respect to a theme.

Explicit Evidence	Inference	What does it mean?
<i>You're not in anything. No clubs. No sports. No nothing. You should do Drama Club with me this year. It will be fun. Plus you always have ideas that nobody else has. You see things that nobody else sees. You're funny Michael.</i>	<i>Reyna was a thoughtful and caring friend because she explained to Michael how he would be a great contribution to the Drama Club.</i>	<i>By trying something new he would bring something needed to the group and he might learn something from being in a club.</i>

5. Teaching the use of academic vocabulary supports analytic essay writing. Teaching vocabulary in isolation does not often transfer to writing; therefore, introducing dynamic academic vocabulary during repeated encounters with a word in various authentic contexts will help students to internalize the use of the words. Teaching students to translate from academic to social language (and back) will support grade-level writing. The teacher models how to speak and write using academic language. The teacher also models how to paraphrase academic texts into more conversational language

Providing students with a difficult expository passage and working in teams to reinterpret the text using everyday language is another way to teach students the appropriate use of academic language.

¹ See TDA Series: Close Reading lesson for instructing students in comprehending and analyzing the text, *Lemonade: The Musical*.

² See TDA Series: Replacement Unit for instructing grade 5 students on understanding the reading elements of characterization and theme.