Dual Credit Program Toolkit

September 2016



COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

333 Market Street Harrisburg, PA 17126-0333 www.education.pa.gov



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Tom Wolf, Governor

Department of Education

Pedro A. Rivera, Secretary

Office of Elementary and Secondary Education

Matt S. Stem, Deputy Secretary

Bureau of Career and Technical Education

Lee Burket, Director

Division of Adult and Postsecondary Career and Technical Education

Tamalee Brassington, Chief

The Pennsylvania Department of Education (PDE) does not discriminate in its educational programs, activities, or employment practices, based on race, color, national origin, [sex] gender, sexual orientation, disability, age, religion, ancestry, union membership, gender identity or expression, AIDS or HIV status, or any other legally protected category. Announcement of this policy is in accordance with State Law including the Pennsylvania Human Relations Act and with Federal law, including Title VI and Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, the Age Discrimination in Employment Act of 1967, and the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990.

The following persons have been designated to handle inquiries regarding the Pennsylvania Department of Education's nondiscrimination policies:

For Inquiries Concerning Nondiscrimination in Employment:

Pennsylvania Department of Education Equal Employment Opportunity Representative Bureau of Human Resources 333 Market Street, 11th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17126-0333 Voice Telephone: (717) 787-4417, Fax: (717) 783-9348

For Inquiries Concerning Nondiscrimination in All Other Pennsylvania Department of Education Programs and Activities:

Pennsylvania Department of Education School Services Unit Director 333 Market Street, 5th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17126-0333 Voice Telephone: (717) 783-3750, Fax: (717) 783-6802

If you have any questions about this publication or for additional copies, contact:

Pennsylvania Department of Education Bureau of Career and Technical Education 333 Market Street, 11th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17126-0333 Voice: (717) 787-5530, Fax: (717) 783-6672 www.education.pa.gov

All Media Requests/Inquiries: Contact the Office of Press & Communications at (717) 783-9802

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Background	1
Research	3
Definitions and Terms	
Policy	5
Program Guidance	6
School-Level Implementation	6
General Considerations: Structuring Dual Credit Programs and Courses	
On-campus/On-site Enrollment Programs: Courses Taught by College Faculty	
Concurrent Enrollment Programs: Courses Taught by Secondary Teachers	
Hybrid/Online Distance Education Courses	9
Establishing Relationships with Postsecondary Partners	9
Identify Institutions of Higher Education (IHE) Partners	9
Establish a Formal Memorandum of Understanding (MOU)	
Establish a Relationship Between the Secondary Entity and IHE	
Faculty Collaboration	
Ensuring Quality	
Articulation: Course Equivalency and Transfer	
Financial Considerations	
Tuition and Fees	
Textbooks, Software, Hardware and Equipment	
Transportation Student Attendance	
Student Attendance Student Admission, Access and Supports	
Student Admission, Access and Supports	
Daily Program Management: Role of School Counselors	
Fulfilling Equity Goals	
Student Supports	
Resources	16
Program Examples	16
On-campus/On-site Programs: Taught by Approved High School Teachers	17
Hybrid/Online Courses	18
Early College High Schools	
Dual Enrollment College-Level Programs (Not Dual Credit)	
PDE Contact Information	
Helpful Links	19
References	19
Appendix A: College Credits Through Articulation Agreements (SOAR)	21

Introduction

This toolkit provides a resource that secondary school entities and postsecondary/institutions of higher education (IHEs) can review and consider when developing and implementing dual credit programs.

Dual credit allows high school students to take college-level, credit-bearing courses offered by institutions of higher education and to receive secondary and postsecondary transcripted credit. **Dual enrollment** means that the student is enrolled in two institutions at the same time but does not address how the credits earned are handled. **Dual credit** means that the student is enrolled in two institutions and receiving transcripted credit for the course both at the high school and career and technical center as well as the sponsoring college. An example of a school where the student does not receive high school credit but can enroll in a college during the school day or summer (dual enrollment) is Central Columbia School District. Students can enroll in courses at Bloomsburg University, but Central Columbia School District does not put the credit on the high school transcript and does not count them towards high school graduation.

The Pennsylvania Department of Education is exploring the inclusion of Dual Enrollment as a proposed indicator for the Pennsylvania School Performance Profile (SPP) formula includes points for "Advanced Placement, International Baccalaureate or College Course" offerings and enrollment in core academic subjects.

This toolkit assists secondary and postsecondary entities by providing implementation strategies for dual credit courses based on research findings and Pennsylvania promising practices. These strategies are equally relevant for academic and career and technical courses. An overview of Pennsylvania policy is supplemented with program guidance on implementing new and strengthening existing dual credit programs that result in college transcipted credit for students.

Background

Currently, many secondary schools and IHEs across Pennsylvania offer students dual credit opportunities to earn transferable, transcripted college credit while in high school. These offerings would be considered college courses in the proposed SPP formula. In academic year (AY) 2014-15 (AY14-15):

- 300 Pennsylvania schools reported 31,864 student course enrollments in 1,006 courses;¹
- 10,814 high school students enrolled in dual or concurrent enrollment programs with Pennsylvania community colleges; and²

¹ Pennsylvania Information Management System, Pennsylvania Department of Education, September 30, 2015. A student in more than one dual or concurrent enrollment course is counted more than once, hence, use of the term "student course enrollments".

² Pennsylvania Information Management System, Pennsylvania Department of Education, September 22, 2015.

 760 high school students enrolled in 1,671 courses and earned a total of 4,792.5 credits at Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education (PASSHE) universities.³ (All of the PASSHE universities, except for Cheyney University of Pennsylvania, enrolled dual or concurrent enrollment students in AY14-15.)

Pennsylvania laws and regulations allow school entities to implement dual credit through dual and concurrent enrollment programs. The Public School Code permits school districts to enter into agreements with one or more institutions of higher education approved to operate in Pennsylvania in order to allow resident students to attend those IHEs while enrolled in the secondary entity and to earn transcripted credit both at the secondary entity and the sponsoring IHE.⁴

Per the Pennsylvania School Code, students enrolled for dual credit in dual or concurrent courses are able to be counted toward the average daily membership as long as the school entity pays the student's tuition, fees, and textbooks.⁵

In the case of PDE-approved Career and Technical Education (CTE) programs, secondary entities may use dual credit as part of locally-developed articulation agreements identified in the CTE program approval system. The federal Carl D. Perkins Grant Program requires articulation agreements between secondary and postsecondary institutions receiving grant funds for PDE-approved CTE programs of study. Every approved CTE program must be articulated to an IHE.⁶ Schools must use the statewide articulation agreement to meet program of study requirements (see Appendix A for details about the statewide articulation agreement program called SOAR). However, secondary entities may use dual credit courses as part of locally-developed articulation agreements in place of articulated courses.

As secondary school entities consider an IHE partner, note that out-of-state colleges must be authorized by PDE before conducting any education activity that awards academic or continuing education credit or charges a fee or tuition, and before establishing a physical presence in Pennsylvania.⁷

The Pennsylvania Child Protective Services Law requires an IHE's employees to obtain Pennsylvania State Police Criminal Background Check (SP-164), Federal (FBI) Fingerprint Criminal Background Check (Criminal History Report) and Pennsylvania Child Abuse History Clearance (CY-113) if they have direct contact with secondary students under the age of 18.8

If the IHE's program is delivered at the high school or career and technical center, the secondary entity should inquire if the IHE concurrent enrollment program is accredited

2

³ Data provided by the Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education Office of the Chancellor on September 30, 2015. Data includes Dual Enrolled High Students and Early Admit High School Students.

⁴ 24 P.S. §§ 1601-B-1615-B

⁵ 22. Pa. Code § 11.5(b)

⁶ 22. Pa. Code § 339.4 Program Approval

⁷ 22. Pa. Code § 31.2 and § 36.1 - 8

^{8 23} Pa. C.S. § 6344 (a.1) (2)

by the <u>National Alliance of Concurrent Enrollment Partnerships (NACEP)</u>, the national accrediting body for concurrent enrollment partnerships. Accredited concurrent enrollment programs have national recognition for following rigorous standards which ensure that students receive high quality dual credit courses in a comprehensive program structure and increases the likelihood of successful credit transferability.

Research

Research indicates that students who participate in college-level coursework dual credit opportunities during their high school enrollment tend to persist in college (U.S. Department of Education, 2006). Dual credit students tend to transition to college better than students who do not participate in college courses during their time in high school.

By providing a pathway for students to move seamlessly between K–12 and postsecondary systems, dual enrollment is thought to promote greater support for students' college aspirations and greater collaboration between high schools and colleges (Bailey & Karp, 2003) (Clark, 2001).

For CTE students, the Education Commission of the States summarized current research on outcomes for CTE students. Three outcomes are supported by research. CTE dual or concurrent enrollment students are more likely to earn a high school diploma, are more likely to enroll in a four-year institution than other dual enrolled students and are slightly more likely to enroll in college full-time (Zinth, 2014).

Researchers examined the City of New York's College NOW program finding that dual and concurrent enrollment reduces time to degree, increased the credit load of students after they matriculate, and increased student college performance as measured by grade point average (Allen & Dadgar, 2012). Another researcher conducted a peer-reviewed study using a quasi-experimental research design using matching demographic variables and prior academic performance found that dual or concurrent enrollment students were more likely to complete a bachelor's degree (An, 2013) and that reconfirmed *The Toolbox Revisited* original findings that students who earned six or more credits gained momentum towards degree attainment with 12 credits guaranteeing forward movement to graduation (U.S. Department of Education, 2006).

Definitions and Terms

There is considerable variation and confusion in the use of the terms dual credit, dual enrollment, and concurrent enrollment. States and organizations from across the county use these terms in different ways, and individual programs and schools often use them interchangeably. Some of the research and policy referenced in this document use the terms interchangeably.

⁹ All concurrent enrollment programs can benefit by using the <u>NACEP standards as a framework for program development.</u>

¹⁰ NACEP Promoting Quality Report, 2010

Programs, guidance, and laws in Pennsylvania also use the terms inconsistently. Hence the definitions used in this toolkit are being provided to clarify the discussion in this toolkit and are not meant to imply that these definitions are codified in Pennsylvania law, school code, the Pennsylvania School Performance Profile, or PIMS.

This toolkit will use the following definitions:

'Dual credit.' A student earns both sponsoring IHE and secondary entity credit for a college course and the credit is transcripted by both institutions at the time of the course. These courses can be either academic or career and technical courses. In this toolkit, dual credit will be used as the umbrella term for all models of earning college credit where the student receives simultaneous transcripted credit for the course from both the sponsoring IHE and the secondary entity.

'Dual enrollment.' A student enrolls in both the secondary entity and the IHE and takes a college course (irrespective of location, instructor type, or delivery method). The student may or may not receive secondary credit for the college courses completed, hence, not all dual enrollment is dual credit.

'Concurrent enrollment.' A student takes a college course taught by an IHE-vetted and approved secondary entity teacher at the secondary school entity. Concurrent enrollment is one model of dual credit hence, credit is transcripted at both the IHE and secondary entity.

'On-campus enrollment or off-site enrollment.' A student takes a college course taught by a regular IHE faculty on the sponsoring college campus or off-site of the campus. On-campus/off-site enrollment is one model of dual credit hence, credit is transcripted at both the IHE and secondary entity.

'Hybrid dual credit course.' An online distance education course supervised by a vetted secondary entity teacher. Instructor of record is an IHE faculty. Hybrid dual credit course is one model of dual credit; hence, credit is transcripted at both the IHE and secondary entity.

'Online dual credit course.' An online dual credit course is a distance education course taught by an IHE faculty where the student participates solely with the IHE faculty member. Online dual credit course is one model of dual credit hence, credit is transcripted at both the IHE and secondary entity.

'Early college high school.' A partnership between at least one local educational agency and at least one institution of higher education that allows participants to simultaneously complete requirements toward earning a regular high school diploma and earn not less than 12 credits that are transferable to the institutions of higher education in the partnership as part of an organized course of study toward a postsecondary degree or credential at no cost to the participant or participant's family."¹¹

-

¹¹ Public Law No. 114-95 §8101 (15)

Policy

This policy section outlines current legal regulations in Pennsylvania that relate to dual credit courses. The legal citations are below in the footnotes.

The Pennsylvania Public School Code permits school districts to enter into agreements with one or more IHEs approved to operate in Pennsylvania in order to allow resident students to attend those IHEs while enrolled in the secondary entity and to earn dual credit, both at the secondary entity and IHE.¹²

Charter schools are not able to enter into dual enrollment agreements with IHEs. Current state regulation prohibits charter schools, which includes cyber charter schools, from entering into dual enrollment agreements.

A public secondary entity must pay for a dual credit student's tuition, fees and textbooks in order to count that student in their average daily membership. ¹³ This applies regardless of the location of instruction.

As previously indicated, in the case of PDE-approved CTE programs, secondary entities may use dual credit as part of locally-developed articulation agreements identified in the CTE program approval system.¹⁴ ¹⁵

Out-of-state institutions of higher education must be authorized by PDE before conducting any education activity that awards academic or continuing education credit or charges a fee or tuition, and before establishing a physical presence in Pennsylvania.¹⁶

The Pennsylvania Child Protective Services Law requires employees of the IHEs to obtain state, federal and child abuse clearances if they have direct contact with secondary students. 17 18

Revised August 2016

5

¹² 24 P.S. §§ 1601-B-1615-B

¹³ 22. Pa. Code § 11.5(b)

^{14 22.} Pa. Code § 339.4 Program approval

¹⁵ Public Law No. 109-270

¹⁶ 22. Pa. Code § 31.2 and § 36.1 - 8

¹⁷ 23 Pa.C.S. § 6344 (a.1) (2)

Act 15 of 2015 amended the Department of Human Services (DHS) Child Protective Services Law and extended the requirement for background checks to certain employees of higher education institutions. This will include a professor who has one student who is also enrolled in a high school but is also taking a course at the higher education institution. It will be the responsibility of the higher education institution to ensure that the required clearances have been obtained. PDE has authority over the issue of background checks for students enrolled in teacher preparation programs. DHS has enforcement authority for all other issues related to background checks in higher education institutions. Excerpts of the guidance provided by DHS on this topic: Are there any exceptions to the certification requirements for employees of an institution of higher education? Yes. Certifications are not required for employees of an institution of higher education whose direct contact with children, in the course of employment, is limited to either: A. Prospective students visiting a campus operated by the institution of higher education; or B. Matriculated students who are enrolled with the institution. THE EXEMPTION UNDER (B)

Program Guidance

As entities develop or modify dual credit courses and strengthen dual or concurrent enrollment programs, experience from the field suggests common issues to consider and potential problems to address. Some of these recommendations come from national organizations or other states with considerable experience with program development and implementation. Not every issue is relevant for every program but this listing of some of the most common issues can assist your school entity or IHE in building a strong program that serves the needs of a wide range of high school students in Pennsylvania.

School-Level Implementation

This section includes information and suggestions for implementing effective dual or concurrent enrollment programs online, on campus, or at the secondary entity. In all dual, hybrid or concurrent enrollment programs, students earn dual credit while enrolled in the secondary entity. Credits appear both on the high school transcript and the college transcript and the college credits are transferrable.¹⁹

Dual or concurrent enrollment programs deliver dual credit in a variety of ways. Depending on the configuration, some issues become more relevant than others. To clarify the discussion of school-level implementation, the following terminology will be used:

TERMINOLOGY USED TO DISTINGUISH DUAL CREDIT COURSES

(by Location, Instructor Type and Delivery Method) All courses, regardless of terminology are dual credit.

Location of Class	Instructor Type		
	Secondary Entity Teacher	IHE Faculty	
At the IHE		On-campus Enrollment	
Online	Hybrid	Online	
At the Secondary Entity	Concurrent Enrollment	Off-site Enrollment	

SHALL NOT APPLY TO STUDENTS WHO ARE ENROLLED IN A SECONDARY SCHOOL. How is matriculated student defined? Matriculated student is defined as a student who is enrolled in an institution of higher education and pursing a program of study that results in a postsecondary credential, such as a certificate, diploma or degree. The complete guidance document is available.

The extent to which any dual credit course is transferable is at the discretion of the receiving institution. The only guaranteed acceptance for any dual credit course is at the IHE that transcripts the dual credit course.

General Considerations: Structuring Dual Credit Programs and Courses
The following are relevant for effective dual credit programs regardless of the
model implemented. Offering dual credit is a partnership between the secondary
entity and the sponsoring IHE hence, the organizations share responsibility in
creating a program that serves the needs of the students while maintaining
program quality. The partnership should:

- Ensure dual credit courses are aligned to district graduation requirements, CTE programs of study or to a career pathway offered at the school. In special cases, a course that is not offered at the secondary entity but that aligns to the student's career goals can be provided through dual credit.
- Establish admissions criteria to ensure students are college-ready. Criteria based on performance on entrance tests or other achievement measures provide the most equitable criteria for participation. Potential measures include tests, end-of-course grades, teacher recommendations and students' work portfolios.
- Engage all parties early in the discussion of goals of the program to determine the organization of the program including such items as location of instruction, who teaches the course, primary contacts, responsibilities, processes, requirements, etc.
- Establish secondary entity funding to pay for tuition, fees and textbooks.
 Some schools use Educational Improvement Tax Credit (EITC) funding or local foundation funding to partially cover costs.
- Ensure that all students earn college credits on an official college transcript.
- Enroll students early in the course. Students should not purchase college credits after the class has been completed and their success is assured. This not an authentic approach for students to experience college-level coursework. Official enrollment should occur prior to mid-terms. Consequences of dropping a class or withdrawing from a class should follow the IHE's transcript policies that are similar for full-time students.
- Consider offering high school courses that ensure that the student achieves sufficient competency that they can avoid developmental courses upon entering an IHE. This can be achieved by offering prerequisite high school courses that prepare students for the college-level courses offered as dual credit such as a rigorous college prep sequence. Faculty collaboration between the secondary teachers and the college faculty can enhance the quality of the courses leading up to the dual credit courses and help students avoid developmental status upon matriculation.
- Dual credit courses should be weighted similarly to advanced placement or international baccalaureate courses in the school's grading system. This includes both academic and technical courses.

On-campus/On-site Enrollment Programs: Courses Taught by College Faculty

 Integrated course enrollment integrates high school students into a traditional college course on the sponsoring IHE campus taught by IHE

- faculty. This is considered by many to be the most authentic form of dual credit for students.
- Standalone courses offer college courses to cohorts of high school students on the college campus or at the high school taught by college faculty. Secondary students are not integrated into classrooms with other college students and the courses are taught by IHE faculty.
- On-campus orientation to high school students should be provided to include issues such as parking rules and regulations, class location, attendance policies, student identification cards, library access, eating facilities, tutoring services or other college provided services that are available to dual credit students.

Concurrent Enrollment Programs: Courses Taught by Secondary Teachers

- All parties must ensure that concurrent enrollment courses retain IHE level of expectations and outcomes.
- The IHE ensures that secondary teacher qualifications are aligned with Middle States Accreditation requirements or other accrediting body expectations for quality. Generally, these qualifications mimic the qualifications for adjunct IHE faculty in the specific discipline being taught.
- Secondary teachers are trained by IHE faculty and serve as adjunct faculty for concurrent enrollment courses offered at a secondary entity to a cohort of high school students.
- The IHE faculty work with and oversee the secondary teachers as they teach the concurrent enrollment course. This includes coordination of course expectations, grading, course logistics, texts, and college policies and procedures.
- To facilitate expansion of the pool of qualified secondary teachers, school entities should consider adjusting hiring qualifications to match IHE adjunct faculty qualifications. Alternatively, the secondary entity could provide financial support for current secondary teachers to gain discipline-specific courses to gain approval as an IHE adjunct for the concurrent enrollment course.
- An approval process is established for short- and long-term substitute secondary teachers in the concurrent enrollment classroom. Establish procedures prior to delivering classes, including a timeframe and procedure for notifying the IHE of the substitution. The secondary entity should submit the substitute's qualifications for IHE evaluation to gain approval for them to teach the concurrent enrollment class as soon as feasible.
- Both enrolled and non-enrolled secondary students can be blended into the same classroom. This is an important strategy for small secondary entities or career and technology centers. Expectations of student performance and course content cannot however be changed to facilitate the blending of students.

IHEs offering concurrent enrollment programs can be accredited by the National Alliance of Concurrent Enrollment Partnerships (NACEP). Programs with accreditation will have met established quality standards for curriculum, faculty, students, assessment and program evaluation. Secondary entities that are working with non-accredited concurrent enrollment programs might use the NACEP standards to assess the quality of the program being offered by their IHE.²⁰

Hybrid/Online Distance Education Courses

- If the IHE faculty is the online instructor of record, a best practice is to have a secondary teacher ensure that the student is making course progress and to provide supplemental instruction as needed. This model works best with groups of students. Students should be assigned a specific time in their schedule to meet with the secondary teacher.
- A student can enroll in online postsecondary courses with the approval of the secondary entity without the oversight of a local secondary teacher. The student works independently with end-of-course grades shared with the secondary entity. This model requires the student to be extremely self-reliant and able to manage time and content independently and is only recommended for mature students.

Establishing Relationships with Postsecondary Partners

Identify institutions of higher education (IHE) partners by:

- Establishing purpose and goals of the dual credit program and find IHE partners who can meet these goals. Multiple IHE partners might be necessary to meet the goals for all students.
- Finding IHE partners through discussions with other secondary entities in the region. Often IHE partners work within an established geographical area so finding potential partners can be facilitated by examining which IHEs are working with other local secondary entities.
- Beginning discussions in the fall for implementation the following academic year. Developing these agreements can take considerable time for both entities. Working out details in time to get courses into the secondary entity's scheduling guide improves the process for students, parents, teachers and school counselors.
- Demonstrating that the IHE and the secondary entity are sensitive to the need for flexible local policies and procedures. Both entities have policies, procedures, and legal requirements that will need to be examined and addressed to facilitate implementation of the program.

²⁰ NACEP program accreditation standards are available on the NACEP website.

Establish a formal Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) that:

- Identifies individuals at the secondary entity and IHE who serve as primary contacts. Include specific names, positions and contact information in the MOU.
- Specifies financial responsibilities of the secondary entity and the IHE.
- Specifies how and when payment for courses and books will occur.
- Identifies the target grade levels.
- Establishes where and how the IHE courses will be offered including a timeline of important deadlines.
- Identifies student access to college facilities and on campus and online services.
- Addresses IDEA and ADA issues. Establishes IEP and 504 plan processes and identifies the responsibilities and timelines of each party.
- Establishes student data sharing agreements.
- Establishes course assessment and teacher assessment responsibilities.
- Should be signed by each institution's highest level of leadership.

Establish a relationship between the secondary entity & IHE that:

- Maintains communication through partnership meetings between the secondary entity and IHE key individuals.
- Identifies individuals beyond the primary contacts at both the secondary entity and the IHE with other defined roles related to program implementation such as placement testing, admissions, academic advising, etc.
- Clarifies who answers parent questions about the program, courses, and student performance.
- Clarifies communication expectations for the secondary teacher and IHE faculty regarding coursework, grading and issues of course standards.
- Determines a timeline for identifying new course offerings, qualifying concurrent enrollment high school teachers, student application, student admission testing, student enrollment, course beginning and end dates, course grading, etc.
- Provides help desk assistance, online and on campus library resources, learning management system access and training, and other key academic resources to students and high school concurrent course teachers as appropriate.
- Clarifies which institution's student rules apply and their consequences in various circumstances (e.g. plagiarism, smoking, aggressive behavior, absenteeism, etc.).
- Shares data to facilitate course and program assessment and evaluation.

Faculty Collaboration

 Collaboration on appropriate secondary course sequences prepares students for enrolling in college-level work. This collaboration should

- occur regardless of the structure of the dual or concurrent enrollment program.
- Establishes communication mechanisms between secondary teachers and IHE faculty on both procedures, student expectations and course content. For concurrent enrollment courses in career and technical program of study sequences, communication must address issues that ensure the course includes the required elements of the CTE program of study and the college course content.
- Establishes discipline-specific professional development opportunities at the IHE for secondary teachers.
- Ensures the secondary entity and the IHE provide mechanisms and funding so that counterparts from both entities can meet.
- For concurrent enrollment programs and hybrid online courses, the
 partnership should conduct course-level professional development to
 ensure the secondary teacher understands content, grading standards
 and pacing of course content. Whenever possible, college faculty should
 be encouraged to share examples of assessment materials including
 laboratory assignments, homework and tests to assure alignment
 between in college content and the content delivered in the secondary
 entity classroom.

Ensuring Quality

- Ensure that course content, rigor, and outcomes are equivalent regardless of who teaches or where the course is delivered. IHE administrators should encourage IHE faculty to share course materials to ensure alignment.
- Implement course-specific annual professional development coordinated by the IHE to enhance course alignment and build relationships between secondary teachers and IHE faculty.
- Enhance transferability of courses by ensuring that the college transcript uses the same course designators and numbers for dual or concurrent students as are used for on campus students.
- Provide access to student support services (tutoring, counseling, online resources, supports for students with disabilities, etc.) to assist students in achieving success. If the student cannot visit the campus to receive these student supports, the IHE should explore online or virtual options to provide services. Secondary entity staff can be trained by the IHE to assist in delivering some of these student supports.

Articulation: Course Equivalency and Transfer

 Assist students and parents in efficient use of college credits through dialogue: the multiple IHE partners should discuss how their courses can be structured together to meet college program requirements for various majors at each IHE. Transferability of courses between IHEs should be addressed, especially between those working within the same secondary school entity, to ensure the maximum benefit for students.

- Create a transfer matrix for the dual credit courses by using the Pennsylvania Transfer and Articulation Center to assist students in matriculating to the IHE of their choice after graduation.²¹ Pennsylvania community colleges, the Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education colleges and several additional colleges participate in this statewide resource that assists students in understanding how their transcripted college credits can transfer between Pennsylvania colleges and universities.
- Address program assessment and evaluation, i.e., course equivalency and transferability experiences of students who matriculated from the dual credit program.
- Support student's graduation plans and align to secondary academic standards and high school graduation requirements. Courses should facilitate long-term education goals for the student. If the dual credit course is an elective course and the student does not plan on pursuing a degree in that subject area, the student should explore with his/her planned IHE how the course might or might not articulate into the degree area he/she plans on pursuing.

Financial Considerations

Tuition and Fees

- The Pennsylvania School Code requires that secondary school entities must pay the tuition for dual or concurrent courses (dual credit) if the entity is submitting the student in the average daily membership used for calculating the basic education subsidy.²²
- Secondary school entities must pay any fees associated with the course including any student application or testing fees.
- The sponsoring IHE can waive the tuition or fee or the IHE can offer a decreased tuition rate or fee.

Textbooks, Software, Hardware and Equipment

- Secondary school entities must assume the cost of the textbook.²³
- Students can elect to purchase the textbook; however, it cannot be a requirement of the program if the secondary school entity is submitting the student for subsidy. Student ownership of textbooks allows the student to mimic student notetaking through writing in textbooks.
- Secondary school entities can place adequate numbers of textbooks in the school library for students to borrow. However, an increasing number of courses require each student to have an online registration for the course materials that is acquired through the purchase of the course materials and cannot be shared or transferred to other students. In these cases,

²¹ The Pennsylvania Transfer and Articulation Center 22 Pa. Code § 11.5(b)

²³ Ihid.

- each student must have their own dedicated copy of course materials to enroll in the course.
- IHE program and instructors should be sensitive to changes in textbooks to ensure that changes are sufficient to warrant the secondary school entities purchasing a new edition of a textbook.
- For concurrent enrollment programs, secondary entities should be aware that certain software, hardware, or equipment purchases might be required to maintain content alignment with the college-level course content. This is particularly true with science, computer-based courses, and other career and technical education programs.

Transportation

- Secondary school entities can establish grants for families to help support transportation to the IHE.
- · By offering concurrent enrollment courses at the secondary entity or offering online and hybrid courses, transportation issues are eliminated.
- Student can pay for transportation fees including bus tokens, parking permits, tolls, or other transportation-related expenses.

Student Attendance

Both the school entity and IHE receive reimbursement funds, average daily attendance and full-time equivalency for a student's attendance in a dual or concurrent course as long as the secondary entity pays the tuition, fees and textbook costs for the student.²⁴

Student Admission, Access and Supports

Student Admission

- Policies should clearly outline eligibility criteria for student participation. These criteria should limit admission only on criteria that relate to a student's ability to succeed in the college-level class otherwise the program risks encouraging inequitable student access. Some criteria are applied for the whole program and other are course-specific. Common program or course admission criteria might include:
 - a placement examination or SAT/ACT score:
 - a minimum age and/or grade level for student participants;
 - a minimum GPA;
 - written recommendation from high school teacher or counselor; or
 - written permission from parent or guardian
- One strategy to expand access is to provide initial college courses that do not require a placement exam such that the student can acclimate to the college environment prior to experiencing courses of higher rigor.
- Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA) issues: Many IHEs have concerns about meeting the requirements under the federal FERPA

²⁴ Ibid.

act and ask parents and students to sign FERPA waivers. However federal government guidance to parents and secondary entities allows information to be shared between the two enrolling institutions without the need for waivers.

Question: "If a student under 18 is enrolled in both high school and a local college, do parents have the right to inspect and review his or her education records?"25 Can the secondary entity and the IHE exchange information on that student without a signed waiver? Response: "If a student is attending a postsecondary institution - at any age - the rights under FERPA have transferred to the student. However, in a situation where a student is enrolled in both a high school and a postsecondary institution, the two schools may exchange information on that student. If the student is under 18. the parents still retain the rights under FERPA at the high school and may inspect and review any records sent by the postsecondary institution to the high school. Additionally, the postsecondary institution may disclose personally identifiable information from the student's education records to the parents, without the consent of the eligible student, if the student is a dependent for tax purposes under the IRS rules."26

 Students with an IEP or a 504 plan should be identified to the IHE as early as possible so that any accommodations that are available for the student can be implemented during the registration and placement testing processes.

Daily Program Management: Role of School Counselors

School counselors and counseling office staff play a key role in managing the day-to-day operation of dual credit programs. While others at the school entity occasionally serve as the single point of contact for the dual credit program, school counselors are the most commonly assigned staff to manage the daily operations of the program.

- The annual student enrollment/course guide and the school's website should include all dual credit options available for students. The materials should identify the IHE, the specific college course descriptions including the IHE course number and name, admission criteria, and how this course counts in the secondary entities graduation requirements as well as any other requirements.
- Parent and student nights should be held (with representatives from the IHE, if possible) to answer questions about courses available, the application process, any financial considerations, student expectations and the transferability of courses.
- School counselors or the program manager should visit the IHE's campus to gain first-hand experience with the IHE. This facilitates subsequent

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁵ Federal government guidance on FERPA for parents and students related to dual credit.

- understanding of the IHE as the school counselor discusses the program with students and parents.
- Systems should be established to track student participation in the application, enrollment, and completion process. When a school entity has dual credit with multiple IHEs, checklists and timelines for each program must be carefully monitored by the program manager to ensure that deadlines are met and that the nuances of each program are addressed in a timely manner.
- Communication devices, such as letters to parents and reminders, should be created so that a system of communication is easy to implement by the program manager can easily implement a system of communication.

Fulfilling Equity Goals

The mission of dual credit programs is to serve a wide range of students, particularly those from groups who attend college at disproportionately low rates. (Hoffman, Vargas, & Santos, 2008)

- Ensure equitable access by examining dual credit policies to ensure that students from lower socio-economic status groups and/or other underrepresented populations have enrollment access to the full range of dual credit opportunities available (Hughes, Rodriguez, Edwards, & Belfield, 2012).
- Provide a sequence of scaffolded college-level courses either as part of the dual credit program or prior to the program such that students can successfully get ready for college and college-level courses.
- The secondary entity should offer dual credit courses at a time in the schedule so that all students (including career and technical education students) can access dual credit courses. Scheduling conflicts can limit access for CTE students who wish to enroll in dual credit academic classes at their sending school.
- Secondary entities should develop approaches to mitigate the financial burden on low income qualified students, such as transportation costs to the IHE's campus.

Student Supports

- Integrate dual credit courses into the student's career portfolio to ensure that courses align to the student's long-range career goals.
- Notify students and parents of dual credit opportunities during scheduling.
 Provide sessions for parents and students with the IHE representative to address any questions or issues.
- Provide detailed information about the program (admission, timelines, advantages/disadvantages, courses available, etc.) on the secondary entity's and IHE's websites including a student handbook specifically for dual credit students.
- Establish counseling for students regarding dual credit course eligibility, process for earning credits, financial costs and transferability. This

15

- counseling can be provided by the IHE or by school counselors who have been trained to understand each IHE's policies.
- Equip students for the expectations of college coursework prior to enrolling. Some of these expectations include the impact of fewer tests and assignments being used to determine grades, how to self-monitor progress, how to work independently, and how to be self-advocates.
 Teach students that it is their responsibility to seek out the course instructor if they are having any problems or need assistance.
- Establish a procedure for on campus dual credit courses so that the secondary entity receives an early warning when students fail to attend classes.
- Provide secondary entity school counselors with knowledge to assist them in working with students to maximize student's utilization of dual credit course credits as the student matriculates to various IHEs.
- Provide on-campus experiences hosted by IHEs for all dual and concurrent enrollment students and parents to assist the student in developing realistic matriculation expectations.

Resources

Program Examples

Each of the following program examples include a listing of the IHE offering the dual, concurrent or hybrid/online courses and a sampling of their high school partners. These references are to serve as examples, however, many of the programs contain program elements that might not fully meet best practice standards.

To further investigate the dual credit programs, the details of the IHE's program can be found on each IHE's website. A link to these websites is provided for each example.

Details about the secondary entity's component can be found by downloading the high school's course scheduling guide or CTCs curriculum guide or by searching the secondary entity's website. A sampling of one or two secondary entity partners is provided for each IHE. Further online searching will be required to find the most current course scheduling guide and dual credit program secondary information.

On-campus/On-site Programs: Courses Taught by College Faculty

- Pennsylvania State University offers dual credit courses at many of its campuses, offering grants-in-aid to reduce the cost of tuition by 50 percent for up to eight credits a semester at campuses. University Park and World Campus courses are excluded from the discount. Campuses with the discount include:
 - Penn State Abington
 - Penn State Beaver
 - Penn State Behrend
 - Penn State Berks

- Penn State Brandywine
- Penn State Fayette
- Penn State Greater Allegheny
- Penn State Hazleton
- Penn State Lehigh Valley
- Penn State New Kensington
- Penn State Schuylkill
- Penn State Shenango
- Penn State Wilkes-Barre
- Penn State Worthington Scranton
- Penn State York

One example of a Penn State secondary partner is <u>Lower Merion School</u> <u>District</u>.

- <u>Luzerne County Community College</u> allows Early College students to enroll at a reduced cost per credit plus a course fee. More than 20 high school partners including <u>Berwick Area High School</u> and <u>Greater Nanticoke Area</u> <u>High School</u> participate.
- <u>Bloomsburg University Advanced College Experience (ACE)</u> allows student to take courses during the school year and over the summer at a reduced rate. Some courses are offered at the high school with college faculty teaching the course. Secondary partners include <u>Shamokin Area High School</u> and Berwick Area High School.

Concurrent Enrollment Programs: Taught by Approved High School Teachers

- Allentown School District provides courses free of charge to students enrolled in the concurrent enrollment program at Lehigh Carbon Community College. Allentown School District's dual or concurrent guide is available in both English and Spanish.
- Pennsylvania College of Technology (NACEP accredited): Penn College NOW concurrent enrollment courses are taught by approved high school teachers at 40 local schools and Career and Technology Centers. Neither fees nor tuition is charged. Partners include Montoursville Area High School, SUN Area Technical Institute, Jersey Shore Area High School, Williamsport Area High School, Monroe Career & Technical Institute, Seneca Highlands Career and Technology Center, etc. Information about the courses for each partner school is found on the Penn College NOW website.
- Williamsport Area High School in partnership with Pennsylvania College of <u>Technology</u> offers scaffolded courses in mathematics to ensure that students are ready for college algebra and trigonometry upon matriculation into the IHE.
- <u>University of Pittsburgh: College in the High School Program</u>. More than 100 schools participate in College in the High School including <u>West Greene Area</u> High School and Penn Hills High School.
- <u>Pennsylvania Highlands Community College</u> (NACEP accredited) partners with more than 50 high schools to offer concurrent enrollment courses at a

reduced tuition rate. Partners include Ligonier Valley School District and Port Allegany School District.

Hybrid/Online Courses

- <u>DeSales University's</u> online dual credit program allows eligible high school students to take college-level courses at a reduced tuition rate. The courses vary each year and are six to eight weeks long.
- <u>Lehigh Carbon Community College</u> secondary partners include <u>Palmerton</u> Area School District.

Early College High Schools

- <u>Eastern University Academy Charter School</u>, founded in 2009, is an early college high school in Philadelphia. Open to all Pennsylvania students, the students prepare for and earn college credits while in high school from <u>Eastern University</u>. Each student creates their own Individualized Learning Plan to guide them through their school experience.
- Gateway to College at Community College of Philadelphia offers Philadelphia School District students who have dropped out of school for at least six months an opportunity to earn a high school diploma and earn college credits. The program is a scholarship program, paying for tuition, fees and books.
- Chester County Intermediate Unit's Technical College High Schools
 campuses (Brandywine, Pennock's Bridge, Pickering) and Delaware County
 Community College is a hybrid career and technical high school/community
 college. The programs are co-located on the three campuses offering both
 high school students and adults college credits. Technical High School
 students can graduate from high school with blended career and technical
 programs and up to 26 college credits of associate degree college courses.
- Pennsylvania Highlands Community College Associates in High School
 Program permits capable students to complete two years of an Associate
 Degree in General Studies (A.A.) while in high school, allowing students to
 transfer to a baccalaureate program upon graduation from high school with
 the equivalent of two years of college completed. Greater Johnstown School
 <u>District</u> and <u>Richland School District</u> are partners.

Dual Enrollment College-Level Programs (Not Dual Credit)

Some secondary entities and IHEs have created programs that allow high school students to have college experiences, however, these programs are NOT dual credit since the student does not simultaneously earn high school credit and transcripted college credit from the experience.

• The University of Pennsylvania's Pre-College Program gives high school juniors and seniors a taste of college by allowing students to enroll in summer courses alongside university undergraduates and earn official academic credit ("Pre-College Program"). In addition, University of Pennsylvania offers a Young Scholars Program for academically exceptional high school students.

Central Columbia High School's course scheduling guide states "University courses may not be used to meet Central Columbia Board of Education approved sequences and graduation requirements. This includes required electives and Pathway electives (page 60)."

PDE Contact Information

Julie Kane, Higher Education Associate, Office of Postsecondary & Higher Education 717.772.3643 Fax 717.772.3622 jukane@pa.gov

David Garnes, Career & Technical Education Advisor, Bureau of Career and Technical Education, 717.783.6859 Fax 717.783.6672 dgarnes@pa.gov

Helpful Links

Broadening the Benefits of Dual Enrollment: Reaching Underachieving and Underrepresented Students with Career-Focused Programs. (Hughes, Rodriguez, Edwards, & Belfield, 2012)

Concurrent Enrollment Program National Standards for Accreditation: National Alliance of Concurrent Enrollment Partnerships (NACEP)

<u>Dual Enrollment: Lessons Learned on School-Level Implementation</u> (Cassidy, Keating, & Young, 2010)

Ten Key Decisions in Creating Early Colleges: Design Options Based on Research (Barnett, Bucceri, Hindo, & Kim, 2013)

References

- Allen, D., & Dadgar, M. (2012, July). Does Dual Enrollment Increase Students' Success in College? Evidence from a Quasi-Experimental Analysis of Dual Enrollment in New York City. *New Directions for Higher Education, Number 158*, 11-20.
- An, B. P. (2013, March). The Impact of Dual Enrollment on College Degree Attainment: Do Low-SES Students Benefit? *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 35(1), 57-75.
- Bailey, T., & Karp, M. (2003). *Promoting College Access and Success: A REview of Credit-Based Transition Programs*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education, Office of Adult and Vocational Education.
- Barnett, E., Bucceri, K., Hindo, C., & Kim, J. (2013, December). <u>Ten Key Decisions in Creating Early Colleges</u>. Columbia University, Teachers College. New York: National Center for Restructuring Education, Schools and Teaching. Retrieved April 5, 2016
- Cassidy, L., Keating, K., & Young, V. (2010). <u>Dual Enrollment: Lessons Learned on School-Level Implementation</u>. Arlington, VA: SRI International. Retrieved April 8, 2016

- Clark, R. (2001). Dual Credit: A Report of Programs and Policies That Offer High School Students College Credits. Seattle, WA: Institute for Educational Inquiry.
- Hoffman, N., Vargas, J., & Santos, J. (2008). On Ramp to College: A State

 Policymaker's Guide to Dual Enrollment Boston: Jobs for the Future. Retrieved April 12, 2016
- Hughes, K. L., Rodriguez, O., Edwards, L., & Belfield, C. (2012). <u>Broadening the Benefits of Dual Enrollment</u> Columbia University, Community College Research Center. San Francisco: The James Irving Foundation. Retrieved June 2016
- U.S. Department of Education. (2006). *The Toolbox Revisited: Paths to Degree Completion from High School through College.* Washington D.C.
- Zinth, J. D. (2014). <u>CTE Dual Enrollment: A Strategy for College Completion and Workforce Investment</u>. Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States. Retrieved April 7, 2016

Appendix A: College Credits Through Articulation Agreements (SOAR)

A comprehensive system of statewide articulation agreements that award college credit to students enrolled in career and technical education programs exists in Pennsylvania. Called SOAR (Students Occupationally and Academically Ready), the program's mission is to prepare students for college and careers in a diverse, high-performing workforce. Though not a dual credit or dual enrollment program, SOAR is the career and technical program of study educational plan that articulates the secondary career and technical programs to postsecondary degree, diploma, or certificate programs.

The Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Improvement Act of 2006 requires the development and implementation of career and technical programs of study. Programs of study incorporate elements of secondary and postsecondary education and include coherent and rigorous content aligned with challenging academic standards and relevant career and technical content in a coordinated, non-duplicative progression of courses. These courses align secondary education with postsecondary education to adequately prepare students to succeed in postsecondary education. Through this framework, the secondary education students have the opportunity to earn postsecondary education credits through articulation agreements with participating postsecondary institutions, which could lead to an industry recognized credential or certificate at the postsecondary level or an associate or baccalaureate degree. The credits are earned in the articulated major at the postsecondary after enrollment, do not carry a letter grade, and are not transferrable.

Articulation for advanced credit transfer is made possible when Perkins-allocated IHEs and Pennsylvania secondary schools offering SOAR programs agree to the terms and conditions stated in the Perkins statewide articulation agreement. This agreement outlines the general agreement conditions between secondary and postsecondary institutions and student qualification measures allowing for the student to acquire postsecondary education credits leading to an industry-recognized credential or certificate at the postsecondary level or an associate or baccalaureate degree.

The specific agreements between IHEs and high school technical programs are online.